

PENTECOSTALISM: NEW OUTPOURING OR ANCIENT HERESY?
THE PAGAN WORSHIP OF BAAL & DIONYSUS AND MODERN PENTECOSTALISM

1. In God Himself there is perfect harmony between His speech, His consciousness, and His life. God has always lived; He has always spoken; and He has always thoroughly understood His Own Word.

2. Within the Trinity, the Word has always acted in understanding harmony with His Own Father and His Own Spirit. Matthew 28:19; Second Corinthians 3:14-18; John 1:1-3. This was so before, and at the beginning of, creation.

3. It was still so, during our Earth's formation week -- when our Divine Father consciously shaped this planet through His Word and by His Spirit. John 17:5; Genesis 1:1-2f; Psalm 33:6f. It was especially the case when the Three Persons of the Triune God consciously and understandingly conversed with One Another right before creating mankind as God's Own image (Genesis 1:26f).

4. For God spoke -- consciously and understandingly -- in order to create man as a living being (Genesis 2:7). Consequently man -- God's image -- was therefore originally righteous, holy, and knowledgable. Ecclesiastes 7:29; Ephesians 4:24; Colossians 3:10.

5. The unfallen Adam was the first true Prophet of the human race. He was thoroughly conscious whenever he spoke. For he altogether understood the contents of his own speech (*cf.* Genesis 2:19f).

6. This is the case also with all subsequent 'True Prophets' (*cf.* First Corinthians 14:32). Unlike the 'ecstatic' and 'unconscious' nature of the later 'false-prophecy' (where the speaker's mouth gets put 'out of gear' with his brain) -- all true prophesyings were coherent. Even 'enthusiastic' Prophets understood their own messages. Thus, no 'ecstasy!'

7. Sadly, God's (originally) good creature Lucifer the Light-bearer fell -- and thus became Satan the evil adversary. Isaiah 14:12-17 *cf.* Revelation 12:7-10. Thus he became a liar, and spoke contrary to his own consciousness of the truth. Genesis 3:1-4; John 8:44; Second Corinthians 11:3f.

8. In the disguise of a very irrationally-speaking or 'ecstatic' serpent, Satan then drove a disharmonious wedge between man's understanding of God's Word on the one hand and man's own word and human consciousness on the other. This brought about the human fall. Genesis 3:1-2,7-8,14-15.

9. In this way, unregenerate or fallen men became irrational in thought, word and deed. Genesis 6:5; Ephesians 4:17f; Titus 1:15. In fact, some even became demon-possessed -- like the witch of Endor who spoke with a strange voice. First Samuel 28:7-15; Isaiah 8:19-20; Luke 8:26-30; and Acts 16:16-18 & 19:13-16.

10. Nevertheless, right after the fall of man, God started saving some men. Thus He reharmonized their consciousness with their words -- by grace, and through their God-given faith in the promised Seed of the woman. Genesis 3:15-20.

11. Others, however, God left in their sinful thoughts and words and deeds. Genesis 4:5-9; 4:23-24; Acts 14:11-16; and Romans 1:18-29. Some of them became idolatrous, like those who ecstatically worshipped the false god Baal. First Kings 16:31-35 & 18:4-20 and Matthew 6:7*f*.

12. But others -- like Balaam the backslidden True Prophet; like Simon the Magician; and like certain of the Corinthian Syncretists -- represent a curious mixture between superstition and falsehood on the one hand and true belief on the other. Numbers chapters 22 to 24; Acts 8:9-14; First Corinthians 12:1-3.

13. So too, really, do very many modern Pentecostals. Of course, other modern (Neo-)Pentecostals are nevertheless genuine (if misguided) Christians.

14. Balaam's ass truthfully yet unconsciously spoke God's Word uniquely and miraculously. Thereby the Lord Himself shamed the "madness" of that backslidden Prophet. Numbers 22:28*f* *cf.* Second Peter 2:12-16. But Balaam himself seems to have drifted off periodically into the "madness" of the Near-Eastern worship of the nature-god Baal -- a worship which Balaam or 'Baal-am' or Bileam himself apparently indulged in.¹ Numbers 22:5-8 & 22:22-34 & 22:41 & 24:4 & 25:1 & 31:16 *cf.* Second Peter 2:15-16.

15. Nevertheless, whenever transmitting True Prophecy -- Balaam consciously spoke God's Word. Numbers 22:9-13 & 22:18-20 & 22:35-38 & 23:5*f* & 24:2*f*. Indeed, he did this from time to time, in spite of his own compromises. Jude 11 *cf.* Revelation 2:14.

16. Periodically, however, the Prophet Balaam became disobedient, and degenerated into a 'false-prophet' -- utilizing various kinds of sorcery. Numbers 22:7,39-41 *cf.* 23:1,4,23,29. Indeed, Balaam "took up his parable" or 'started his saying' while "falling into a trance but having his eyes open" (Numbers 24:3-4 & vv. 15-16).

17. Calvin rightly comments here that the backslidden prophet Balaam (just like the later Montanists and many modern Pentecostals!) "had no fixed or solid views with regard to the service [or worship] of God." Balaam, observed Calvin, "worshipped idols promiscuously among the heathen -- either because he was involved in the same superstitions, or because he made no difficulty in complying with any customs or rites."

18. Significantly, the Apostle Peter warns Christians against false-prophets even in the New Testament Church: "There were false prophets even among the people [of Israel], just as there shall be false-prophets among you." Such false-prophets "have forsaken the right way and are gone astray, following the way of Balaam (and) the madness" of that Prophet (Second Peter 2:1,15-16). "Woe unto them! For they have gone into the way of Cain, and have run greedily after the error of Balaam" who even stood on "the high places of Baal." Jude 11 *cf.* Numbers 22:41.

19. "I have a few things against you," Christ told His church at Pergamos. "Because you have those who hold the doctrine of Balaam who taught Balak to cast a stumblingblock before the people of Israel...to commit fornication!" Revelation 2:12-14 *cf.* Numbers 25:1 & 31:16 and First Corinthians 10:8. Antinomians -- be astutely aware!

20. The false prophets of Baal (who served Queen Jezebel the lascivious worshipper of the false goddess Astarte) were apparently then in ecstatic excitement. They then seem to have been unconscious of pain while cutting themselves. And they also seem to have been uncomprehending of their own speech, while droning on from morning until noon with their '*batto-logia*' (or their muttering and uttering '*batta-batta-batta*') alias "their vain repetition of words." First Kings 16:31-35 & 18:4,25-29 *cf.* Matthew 6:7-8. Pentecostals -- please perceive!

21. This droning or stammering clearly involved unconscious ecstatic utterances as a result of demon possession. So too did the later Pre-Christian pagan rites at Corinth (*cf.* First Corinthians 12:1-3). So too did the yet-later syncretistic behaviour of the raving Montanists. And so too do many cases of ecstatic utterances in Pentecostalism, even today. Indeed -- as we shall soon demonstrate -- ecstatic Montanism is a dim descendant (*via* the Pre-Christian Cybele-rites in Phrygia and in Corinth) of the Near-Eastern false religion of Baal and its Greek equivalent Dionysus.

22. Moreover, the worship of Elijah's God is quite irreconcilable with devotion to Baal -- as well as with the Baal-like worship practices of the later Montanists. "For what agreement does Christ have with Belial [or Baal]? And what agreement does the temple of God have with idols? Therefore, come out from among them and do not touch the unclean thing..., says the Lord Almighty!" Second Corinthians 6:15-18.

23. "I have a few things against you!" -- the Lord Jesus Christ warned His church at Thyatira. For "you allow that woman Jezebel, who calls herself a Prophetess, to teach -- and to seduce My servants to commit fornication and to eat things sacrificed to idols!" Revelation 2:18-20.

24. Fallen man had lapsed into gross idolatry and horrible immorality. See Romans 1:18-32. Indeed, even in Mosaic times, the Canaanites (like the later Phoenicians) had worshipped the nature-god Baal and the nature-goddess Astarte. *Cf.* Exodus 34:13 and Judges 2:13 & 6:25 with First Kings 14:22*f.*

25. In fact, the bull-god Baal was substantially the same nature-god as the pagan Babylonian nature-god Bel and the Sumerian sun-god Shemesh (and the Egyptian sun-god Ra and the Greek nature-god Dionysos alias Bacchus). Indeed, Astarte is the same Syrian nature-goddess as the ancient Babylonian and Sumerian moon-goddesses -- and the Egyptian nature-goddess Isis, and the Greek nature-goddess Cybele and the sex-goddess Aphrodite and also the moon-goddess Diana (*cf.* Acts 19:27-35).

26. For all Pagans everywhere had progressively corrupted the worship of the true God Jehovah -- into idolatry. Idolatry with all of its various false-gods and false-goddesses!

27. We are told there was wild feasting and playing and singing and dancing round Aaron's "Egyptian" golden calf (Exodus 32:5-19). Compare this with the worship of Baal among the immoral Moabites and Midianites! Numbers. 22:1-4,41 & 25:1 & 31:7-16.

28. Indeed, Aaron's calf certainly seems to have been connected with the idolatrous and immoral worship of the sex-goddess Astarte. Exodus 34:13 *cf.* First Corinthians 10:7*f.* For even in Mosaic times, the Canaanites (just like the later Phoenicians) boldly worshipped the sun-god Baal and the moon-goddess Astarte. Exodus 34:13 and Judges 2:13 & 6:25 *cf.* First Kings 14:23*f.* Too, the Phoenician and the Canaanite and the Egyptian and the Sumerian sun-gods and moon-goddesses all seem to root in Nimrod's idolatry (*cf.* Sabaeism) at the tower of Babel in Ur (the seat of the firegod of the Chaldees). Genesis 10:8-12 & 11:3-9,28.

29. Now what do the various leading modern encyclopedias say about all of this in their entries under 'Baal' and 'Astarte' *etc?* The *Encyclopaedia Britannica* says² that "Baal [was] a god worshipped in many ancient Near-Eastern countries, especially among the Canaanites, who apparently considered him a fertility deity.... Knowledge of Baal's personality and functions derives chiefly from a number of tablets uncovered from 1929 onward at Ugarit (modern Ras Shamra) in northern Syria, and dating to the middle of the 2nd millennium (or around 1500) B.C.

30. "Ugaritic texts tell of other fertility aspects of Baal -- such as his relations with Anath, his consort and sister, and also his siring a divine bull-calf.... The myths also tell...[that] Baal persuaded Asherah....

31. "The worship of Baal was popular from the 14th century B.C. onward, in Egypt (*cf.* Exodus 32:5-19 & 34:13).... 'Baal' further north designated the Lord of Lebanon or of Ugarit. What made the very name of Baal *anathema* to the Israelites, was the program of Jezebel, in the 9th century, to introduce into Israel her Phoenician cult of Baal in opposition to the native worship of Yahweh (First Kings 18).... Asherah, the ancient West-Semitic goddess..., was frequently paired with Baal.... Asherah was usually given the name 'Baalat'" (meaning 'Mistress')....

32. "Dionysus -- also called Bacchus in Greek religion" -- corresponded to Baal and was actually "a nature-god of fruitfulness...especially known as a god of wine and **ecstasy**." See the reproduction of the Paris National Museum's plate-like vase depicting 'Ecstatic Dionysos' -- on our outside front cover above. "Introduced from Thrace and Phrygia [in Asia Minor]..., his orgiastic cult represented a reversion to Pre-Hellenic Minoan [*cf.* Proto-Philistinian or Canaanite] nature-religion....

33. "According to the most popular tradition, Dionysus...[was clearly] in origin a Phrygian earth-goddess.... The novel and exciting *orgia* (rites) of Dionysus, quickly won converts among the women.... The women...took to the hills, wearing fawn skins and crown of ivy and shouting 'Euoi!' -- the ritual cry.... They danced by torchlight to the rhythm of the flute and the *tympanon* (kettledrum). While they were under the god's inspiration, the Bacchantes were believed to possess occult powers [and] the ability to charm snakes [*cf.* the Tennessee Pentecostalistic Hillbilly Snake Handlers]....

34. "The worship of Dionysus flourished long in Asia Minor, particularly in Phrygia [the Headquarters of the later pseudo-glossalalic if not Neo-Dionysian Montanists].... His cult was closely associated with that of numerous Asiatic deities.... Dionysus did...possess the gift of 'prophecy' -- and at Delphi he was received by the priesthood on almost equal terms with Apollo....

35. "[The Minoan] Philistines, a people of Aegean origin..., settled on the southern coast of Palestine in the 11th century B.C. shortly before the arrival of the Israelites. According to Biblical tradition (Deuteronomy 2:23 & Jeremiah 47:4 *etc.*), they came from Caphtor [*cf.* Genesis 10:14 & 10:6-20].... The whole of the country [of Canaan] was later called Palestine by the Greeks.... There are no documents in the Philistine language, which was probably replaced by Canaanite.... Nor is much known of the Philistine religion, since all their gods mentioned...were probably borrowed from the conquered Canaanites....

36. Now "the Phoenicians called themselves...Kena'ani (Kinahna), 'Canaanites'.... The religion of the Phoenicians was inspired by the powers and processes of nature.... A pantheon was presided over by the father of the gods, 'El.' 'Asherah of the Sea' was his wife -- and their [the gods'] mother. Of his [El's] family, the goddess Astarte (Ashtart) was the principal figure."

37. To this, the *New Illustrated Columbia Encyclopedia* adds that "Phoenicians...were Canaanites.... In the 9th century B.C. the Greeks gave the new appellation 'Phoenicians' to those Canaanites who lived on the seacoast and traded with the Greeks.... They worshiped fertility gods and goddesses generally designated by the names 'Baal' and 'Balaat'....

38. "'Philistines'...[were] inhabitants of Philistia -- a non-Semitic people who came to Palestine from the Aegean...in the 12th century B.C..... 'Philistine' has come to mean an uncultured, materialistic person.... See A.R. Burn: *Minoans, Philistines, and Greeks* (1930)."

39. The *Encyclopedia Americana* adds that "'Baal' was more a title, like the English 'Lord'.... The Akkadian form 'Bel' was used in Mesopotamia for the old Sumerian 'Enlil'...and later for 'Marduk' god of Babylon and 'Asshur' god of Assyria.... In the Ugaritic pantheon, he was the son of Dagan (*cf.* Judges 16:23 and First Samuel 5:2-7)...and Baal-zebul the healing god of Ekron (Second Kings 1:2*f*)....

40. "In the time of King Ahab, his wife Jezebel (a Phoenician princess) actively promoted the worship of her Baal -- probably Melkart, god of Tyre.... In New Testament times, the name Baal-zebul became a synonym for Satan.... Matthew 10:25 & 12:24-27....

41. "Astarte...was a Semitic goddess of sexual activity.... She was the female counterpart of Baal...[and] the chief goddess of the Phoenician Sidonians.... Her worship by the Israelites was denounced as idolatry in the Old Testament, where she is referred to derogatorily as 'Ashtoreth' -- a form of the name derived from the Hebrew word 'bosheth' or 'shame'....

41. "Astarte appears in records as early as 1478 B.C., in the *Annals of Thutmose III* (in Egypt). *Cf.* Exodus 32:5*f* & 34:13. She is depicted as a goddess of sexual activity in the

Babylonian *Gilgamesh Epic*.... The fact that the Greeks later identified her with Aphrodite, is further evidence of her role in this respect.... There was also a statue of her...at the Phoenician colony of Cythera (in southern Greece).... Astarte was more widespread among Semitic peoples than any other god.... The cult of Ishtar (Astarte) had a close tie-up with the planet Venus."³

42. The great Biblical Theologians Keil and Delitzsch comment⁴ at Exodus 32:4f that "the 'golden calf'...was copied from the Egyptian Apis.... When Aaron saw it, he built an altar in front of the image -- and called aloud to the people: 'Tomorrow is a feast of Jehovah'" Thus, "in the same manner..., the Egyptians celebrated their feast of Apis!"

43. At Exodus 34:13, they add: "The warning against friendship with the idolatrous Canaanites (vv. 11-16) is more fully developed and more strongly enforced than in chapter 23:23 *sqq.* The Israelites...were to destroy all the signs of their idolatrous worship -- such as altars, monuments (see chapter 23:24), and *asherim* (the idols of Astarte the Canaanitish goddess of nature)....

44. "Literal prostitution...was frequently associated with the worship of Baal and Astarte (*cf.* Leviticus 17:7; 20:5-6; Numbers 14:33; *etc.*). We may see from Numbers 25:1 *sqq.* [*cf.* Numbers 22:41!] how Israel was led astray by this temptation in the wilderness."

45. At Judges 2:13, Keil and Delitzsch comment that the Israelites "forsook Jehovah and served Baal and the Astartes. In this case, the singular 'Baal' is connected with the plural 'Ashtaroth' -- because the male deities of all the Canaanitish nations and those that bordered upon Canaan were in their nature one and the same deity -- *viz.* Baal, a sun-god, and as such the...source of physical life and of the generative and reproductive power of nature....

46. "Ashtaroth -- from the [Semitic] singular '*Ashtoreth*' which only occurs again in First Kings 11:5-33 and Second Kings 23:13 in connection with the Sidonian Astarte -- was the general name used to denote the leading female deity of the Canaanitish tribes, [namely] a moon-goddess who was worshipped as the feminine principle of nature.... It corresponded to the Greek Aphrodite.... The word 'Ashtoreth' is without any traceable etymology in the Semitic dialects, and was probably derived from upper Asia -- being connected with a Persian word signifying a star, and synonymous with Astroarchê, the star queen of Sabaeism." Cf. Nimrod's "fire-worship" at Ur in Genesis 10:8-12 & 11:3-9,28.

47. Jezebel, the Phoenician Queen of apostate Israel -- was the daughter of Ethbaal (or "With-Baal"), king of Sidon. She married Ahab, the apostate king of Israel, who then himself "served Baal and worshipped him." First Kings 16:30-31f.

48. Keil and Delitzsch comment that Baal was "the principal male deity of the Phoenicians and Canaanites...called by the Babylonians Bel.... As the sun-god, [he] was worshipped as the supporter and first principle of psychical life and of the generative and reproductive power of nature. See at Judges 2:13. 'And Ahab made '*eth-hâ'âshêrâh*' -- *i.e.* the Asherah belonging to the temple of Baal (First Kings 16:33) -- see at Judges 6:25 and Exodus 34:13 -- an idol of Astarte (see at chapter 14:23)."⁵

49. "*Matsêbôth* are not actual images of gods, but stones set up as memorials.... As the *matsêbôth* of the Canaanites were dedicated to Baal, so were the *'ashêrîm* to Astarte, the female nature-deity of those tribes."

50. *'Ashêrâh* means "an idol of the Canaanite nature-goddess.... The name *'ashêrâh* was transferred from the idol to the goddess of nature (cf. [First Kings] 15:13 & 18:19 and Second Kings 21:7 etc.), and was used of the Phoenician Astarte ([First Kings] chapter 16:33 and Second Kings 13:6 & 17:16 etc.) -- just as *'ashêrôth* in Judges 4:7 alternates with *'ashêrôth* in Judges 2:13.

51. "These idols [even] the Israelites...associated with the worship of Jehovah" -- by way of later syncretism! "The male *qêdêshîm* [or 'sodomites'] had emasculated themselves in religious frenzy, in honor of the Canaanitish goddess of nature -- and were called 'Galli' by the Romans. (Cf. the Archigallus, alias Attis the high priest of the Greeks' Cybele or the great mother-goddess.)

52. "They [the male *qêdêshîm*] were Canaanites who had found their way into the land of Judah, when idolatry gained the upper hand.... They appear here as 'strangers' among the Israelites -- and travelled about in all directions, begging for the Syrian goddess.... Even in the time of Augustine [A.D. 400], they went about asking for alms in the streets of Carthage, as a remnant of the Phoenician worship."⁶ For Augustine's Carthage, like Phrygia, was a colony of Phoenicia.

53. Keil and Delitzsch give also a good description of the behaviour of the priests of Baal and Astarte on Mount Carmel. It reminds one very much of the rites of the later Montanists (who, as newly-baptized recruits to Christianity just before then still worshipping Astarte, derived much of their ritual from this early Canaanitish and Phoenician Paganism).

54. So too (though without knowing this!) do modern Pentecostals. See paragraphs 432-36 below. For modern Pentecostalism is largely a revival of Montanism.

55. Comment Keil and Delitzsch: "The prophets of Baal...called solemnly upon Baal from morning to noon.... No answer had been received before noon.... The priests of Baal did actually begin therefore to cry louder than before -- and scratched themselves with swords and lances, till the blood poured out 'according to their custom.'

56. "Statements made by ancient authors concerning the processions of the strolling bands of the Syrian goddess (state): 'A discordant howling opens the scene. They then rush wildly about, in perfect confusion.... One of them, who surpasses all the rest in frenzy, begins to "prophesy" with sighs and groans.... The Galli...cuts himself with swords.... The climax of the Bacchi-antic (or Dionysian) dance in the case of the priests of Baal..., was the "prophesying."'"⁷

57. Rev. Professor Dr. J.R. Lumby tells us in his *Cambridge Bible* comment on First Kings 18:19-29 that "Jezebel had introduced the female as well as the male divinity -- so that nothing might be wanting to the complete observance of the worship to which she had been trained at home (in Phoenicia).... One part of the heathen worship consisted of a dance

around the altar, during which the devotees wrought themselves up to a pitch of frenzy -- and then their action took the form of wild leaping....

58. "Picture Baal as so pre-occupied by thought, as not to hear the loud cries of these frantic 'prophets'!... The Baal-dance was most likely performed by the chief devotees with weapons in their hands, and with these it was that in their frenzy they wounded themselves [in] the wild raving of these heathen priests acting under some influence which he cannot control....

59. "It appears to have been of the nature of raving.... The limbs...are agitated; their thoughts are snatched aside."⁸ What a preview of today's 'Holy Rollers!'

60. Rev. Professor Dr. John Gray (of the University of Aberdeen) comments: "Asherah (Ugaritic 'Atrt) was the mother-goddess in the Canaanite fertility cult.... Protesting against the assimilation of the nature-cult of Canaan in its grosser external aspect, had been voiced.... The addition of 400 dervishes of Asherah are...prompted by the mention of the dervishes of Baal.... The Baal-devotee...sought on behalf of the community to promote a new effusion of life...in the fertility cult of Canaan....

61. "A feature of Canaanite prophecy...is suggested by the case of the **ecstatic**. [The mediation of the will of God in intelligible speech was the distinctive feature of Hebrew prophecy!] The ecstatic ministers of imitative magic were naturally numerous.... A local manifestation of Baal in Lebanon, was *Baal Marqad* ('Baal of the Dance').... Baal's sleeping and requiring to be awakened, may refer to some ritual awakening of the god known in the fertility cult.... The dervish rites and the ecstatic behaviour [were] often indistinguishable from the conduct of a **madman**."

62. Rev. Professor Dr. G.B.A. Gerdener taught at the Reformed Theological Seminary at the University of Stellenbosch. He rightly comments that the Lord Jesus Christ's condemnation of "vain repetitions of words" in prayer [Matthew 6:7], "reminds us of the imitative sounds of the Heathen, such as those of the priests of Baal on Mount Carmel."¹⁰

63. Rev. Professor Dr. Wilhelm Bousset, in his commentary on Revelation 2:18-21 -- following Schürer in connection with "Jezebel" -- discusses "a sanctuary of the Chaldean sibyl in Thyatira (verse 18). One could just as well call 'Jezebel' a 'Christian pseudo-prophetess' as call her 'that Heathen sibyl.'" Yet "in this 'Jezebel' we are to see a false libertinistic 'prophetess'....

64. "It is remarkable that false-prophecy needed to be opposed precisely here in Thyatira -- which was later indeed probably one of the chief seats of Montanism.... It seems that even the montanistically-oriented martyrs Carpus and Papyrus hailed from Thyatira (*cf.* Harnack's *Acts of Carpus*, V:433f)!"

65. Indeed, also Rev. Professor Dr. Ernst Wilhelm Hengstenberg comments¹¹ that "Vitranga has shown...the 'Old Jezebel' assumed the character of a false-prophetess." This is evidenced by "the enthusiastical conduct of the servants of the Baal-worship, which she introduced with fanatical zeal."

66. The ecstatic Baal-worship on Mount Carmel (First Kings 18:19-29 *cf.* Matthew 6:7-8) derived from Jezebel's worship of the Phoenician sex-god Baal and sex-goddess Astarte. First Kings 16:31-35 & 18:4 *cf.* Revelation 2:20. Baal is the Phoenician version and ancestor of the pagan Greek god Adonis. And Astarte is the Phoenician form of the ancient Greek goddess Cybele and her Archigallus or high priest Attis.

67. Also Showerman, in the *Hastings's Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics*, declares that "Cybele...was known as the universal mother -- of gods and men, as well as of the lower creation.... Her character as the mother of wild Nature was especially prominent -- and was manifested by the orgiastic wildness in her worship....

68. "Her early attendants in legend, the Corybantes, Idaean Daktyloi, and sometimes Curetes -- were wild demonic beings, probably ithyphallic (or with erect male organs).... The priests of Cybele..., clad in female garb, ...wore their hair long...and celebrated rites to the accompaniment of flutes, cymbals, tamborines and castanets, yelling and dancing themselves into a frenzy until their excitement culminated in self-scourging, self-laceration, and exhaustion (*cf.* First Kings 18:19f).... Her [Cybele's] religious importance lay in her mysticism and in the closeness of her contact with the common people -- and was very great, in spite of the gross practices which grew up around her cult."

69. Declares the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* of 'Astarte': "As the great nature-goddess, the attributes of fertility and reproduction are characteristically hers. As also the accompanying immorality, which originally...was often nothing more than primitive magic.... Her star was the planet Venus."

70. At its article on the 'Corybantes' -- the *Britannica* declares¹² that they were "wild, half-demonic beings, mythical attendants of the Asiatic Great Mother of the gods.... A prominent feature of the ritual was a wild dance which was claimed to have powers of healing mental disorders."

72. The *Encyclopedia Americana*¹³ calls Astarte "a Syrian goddess, probably identical with the Semele of the Greeks. In First Samuel 21:10, Astarte is...mentioned, as also the fact that a temple was built to her in Ashkelon....

73. "The Syrians also built a famous temple to her in Hierapolis, at Tyre, and at Sidon. She is probably identical with the Assyrian goddess Ishtar or Istar the 'Lady' -- the 'Queen of the gods' or the virgin-goddess of death and war who enforces strict chastity upon her priests and priestesses."

74. Declares the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* of the 'Great Mother of the Gods': "'Cybele' is her favourite name..., while 'Great Mother of the Gods'..., the most frequently recurring epigraphical title, was her ordinary official designation. The legends agree in locating the rise of the worship of the Great Mother in Asia Minor in the region of...the Phrygian Empire of prehistoric times.... She was the great parent of gods and men.... Especial emphasis was placed upon her maternity over wild nature..., manifested by the orgiastic character of her worship.

75. "Her attendants -- the *Corybantes* -- were wild, half-demonic beings. Her priests -- the Galli -- were eunuchs, attired in female garb, with long hair fragrant with ointment. Together with priestesses, they celebrate her rites with wild music and dancing....

76. "The immediate direction of the cult of the Great Mother devolved upon the high priest *Archigallus*, called Attis -- [and] a high priestess, *Sacerdos Maxima*.... Besides other priests, priestesses and minor officials -- such as musicians, curators (*etc.*) -- there were certain colleges connected with the administration of the cult....

77. "March 24, *Dies Sanguis* (a 'Day of Blood'), was a day of mourning, fasting and abstinence -- especially sexual -- commemorating the sorrow for the Mother for Attis. The frenzied dance and self-laceration of the priests and the self-mutilation of neophytes, were special features of the Day. The *taurobolium* (or 'baptism by bull's blood') was often performed on this Day, on which probably took place the initiation of mystics [*cf.* First Corinthians 12:2f & 15:29]....

78. "Her [Cybele's] importance in the history of religion, is very great. For her cult, like the other mystic worships, at once formed a rival to Christianity.... According to Diodorus, Cybele was [supposed to have been] the daughter of the Phrygian king Maeon.... She invented fifes and drums, with which she cured the diseases of beasts and children...and fell violently in love with Attis....

79. "Her cult was centralized at Phrygia, whence it found its way into Greece as early as the latter half of the sixth century B.C..... Under the Roman Empire, it became one of the three most important Roman cults, and was one of the last pagan worships to give way before Christianity."

80. Maintains the 1979 *Encyclopedia Americana*:¹⁵ "Cybele..., in mythology, was a nature-deity and the 'Great Mother' goddess of Anatolia [alias Asia Minor]. She was worshipped by the ancient Phrygians under the name Agdistis.... Cybele's cult-attendants were emasculated priests called Galli -- or, in Greece, the Corybantes. They were said to accompany the goddess with wild dances and frenzied music....

81. "Attis (was) the prototype of the eunuch-priest. As Cybele's youthful male consort, Attis castrated himself to ensure fidelity to her.... The worship of Cybele...was prominent throughout Asia, [and] was introduced into Greece after the Persian War [B.C. 500f]....

82. "Under the [Roman] Republic (509 to 27 B.C.), her worship was forbidden to Roman citizens. It was again accorded official status by Emperor Augustus (B.C. 27 to 14 A.D., *cf.* Luke 2:1). Then the cult spread rapidly throughout the provinces" -- and so to Corinth and even back into Phrygia (*cf.* First Corinthians 12:1-2 and Revelation 2:18-22 & 2:14f with Numbers 22:41).

83. Writes the famous student of religions Sir James Frazer (in his great work *The Golden Bough*): "The 'prophets' of Baal (Adon-is) sought to procure rain by cutting themselves with knives till the blood gushed out [*cf.* First Kings 18:19-29].... The worship of

Adon-is was practised by the Semitic peoples of Babylonia and Syria, and the Greeks borrowed it from them as early as the seventh century before Christ.

84. "The true name of the deity [Adonis], was Tammuz (*cf.* Ezekiel 8:14*f*). The appellation of Adon-is, is merely the Semitic *Adon* 'lord' (*cf.* *baal*), a title of honor by which his worshippers addressed him....

85. "Tammuz appears as the youthful spouse or lover of Ishtar (or Astarte).... The myth of Adon-is was...celebrated with much solemnity at Byblos on the coast of Syria."

86. This city was one of the "great seats of the worship of Aphrodite, or rather of her Semitic counterpart Astarte.... Byblos was...the oldest city in Phoenicia.... In historical times, it ranked as a holy place...and contained a great sanctuary of Astarte.... Halfway between Byblos and Baalbec..., at Aphaca there was a famous grove and sanctuary of Astarte.

87. "In the great Phoenician sanctuary of Astarte at Byblos, the death of Adon-is was annually mourned.... Women who could not bring themselves to sacrifice their beautiful tresses, had to give themselves to strangers on a certain day of the festival and to dedicate to Astarte the wages of their shame."¹⁶

88. Frazer next discusses the development of the Syrian religion of Baal/Astarte in the later Pagan-Greek religion of Attis/Cybele. Says he: "Another of those gods whose supposed death and resurrection struck such deep roots into the faith and ritual of Western Asia, is Attis. He was to Phrygia what Adon-is was to Syria....

89. "Attis was said to have been beloved by Cybele the mother of the gods, a great Asiatic goddess of fertility who had her chief home in Phrygia.... The Galli, the emasculated priests of Attis, traversed in procession -- carrying the image of the goddess and chanting their hymns to the music of cymbals and tamborines, flutes and horns." See First Corinthians 12:2 & 13:1 & 14:7.

90. "Emperor Claudius," who ruled the Roman Empire from 41 through 54 A.D., "incorporated the Phrygian worship...and with it probably the orgiastic rites of Attis in[to] the established religion of Rome" -- before Paul wrote First Corinthians 12:1-2*f* in Claudius's reign, and around 53*f* A.D. "The Roman ceremonies, were also Phrygian.... The 24th of March was known as the 'Day of Blood.'"¹⁷

91. Continues Frazer: "The Archigallus or high priest drew blood from his arms and presented it as an offering. Nor was he alone in making this blood sacrifice." This high priest was "stirred by the wild barbaric music of clashing cymbals, rumbling drums, droning horns and screaming flutes." See First Corinthians 12:2 & 13:1 & 14:7!

92. Then "the inferior 'clergy' whirled about in the dance, with waggling heads and streaming hair, until -- rapt into a frenzy of excitement and insensible to pain -- they gashed their bodies (*cf.* First Kings 18:19-29).... Wrought up to the highest pitch of religious excitement" and vain repetitions of words (*cf.* Matthew 6:7-8), "they dashed the severed portions of themselves against the image of the cruel goddess. These broken instruments of

fertility were afterwards reverently wrapped up and buried in the earth or in subterranean chambers sacred to Cybele."

93. Continues Frazer: "Other Asiatic goddesses of fertility, were served in like manner by eunuch priests. These feminine deities required to receive from their male ministers who (im)personated the divine lovers, the means of discharging their beneficent functions. They had themselves to be impregnated by the life-giving energy, before they could transmit it to the world.

94. "Goddesses thus ministered to by eunuch priests, were the great Artemis (or Diana) of Ephesus (*cf.* Acts 19:26-35) -- and the great Syrian Astarte of Hierapolis (in Phrygia) [*cf.* Colossians 4:13 with First Timothy 5:22].... The unsexed priests of this Syrian goddess resembled those of Cybele so closely, that some people took them to be the same. And the mode in which they dedicated themselves to the religious life, was similar....

95. "Multitudes thronged to the sanctuary from Syria and the regions about. While the flutes played, the drums beat [*cf.* First Corinthians 13:1 & 14:7] -- and the eunuch-priests slashed themselves with knives [*cf.* I Kings 18:25*f.*].... Man after man -- his veins throbbing with the music, his eyes fascinated by the sight of the streaming blood -- flung his garments from him, leaped forth with a shout, and...castrated himself on the spot...after the frenzies of a fanatical religion."

96. Concludes Frazer:¹⁸ "The parallel of these Syrian devotees [to Astarte], confirms the view that in the similar worship of Cybele the sacrifice of virility took place on 'the Day of Blood'.... When night had fallen, the sorrow of the worshippers was turned to joy.... At Rome, and probably elsewhere, the celebration took the form of a carnival.

97. "It was the Festival of Joy (*Hilaria*). A universal license prevailed. Every man might say and do what he pleased.... A wine was brewed from...[pine] seeds, and this may partly account for the orgiastic nature of the rites of Cybele which the ancients compared to those of Dionysus.

98. "The worship of the 'Great Mother of the Gods' and her lover or son (Attis), was very popular under the Roman Empire [from B.C. 61 to B.C. 31 onward].... Their worship survived the establishment of Christianity by Constantine [in A.D. 313-21 onward]. For Symacchus records the recurrence of the festival of the 'Great Mother'; and in the days of Augustine [A.D. 400], her effeminate priests still paraded the streets and squares of Carthage.... The ecstatic frenzies which were mistaken for divine inspiration [and] the mangling of the body...have all their origin in savagery....

99. "Christianity itself" -- in Montanism [and in modern Pentecostalism!] -- "has not uniformly escaped the taint of these unhappy delusions. Indeed, it has often been sullied by the extravagances of vain pretenders to a divinity equal to or even surpassing that of its great Founder. In the second century, Montanus the Phrygian claimed to be the incarnate Trinity, uniting in his single person God the Father, God the Son, and God the Holy Ghost" [*cf.* the modern 'Jesus-only Pentecostals']. Thus Sir James Frazer.

100. Declares the 1929 *Encyclopaedia Britannica*: "An Egyptian record (*circa* 1100 B.C.) relates how an envoy, Wenamon, secured a hearing when a youth in attendance on a Phoenician prince prophesied ecstatically.... Very instructive is the famous passage in First Kings 18:19 *sqq.*, concerning the 850 'prophets' of the (Phoenician!) Baal and the Asherah maintained by Queen Jezebel.

101. "At a much later period, the orgiastic rites celebrated by devotees in honour of certain ostensibly-Greek deities [Apollos & Dionysius], prove to have connections with the Baal worship of Syria and Phoenicia (so T.H. Robinson). When parallel phenomena are still exhibited by the dervish fraternities in Islam, it seems probable that this form of religious excitement was peculiarly congenial to the people of western Asia Minor and may well have been of immemorial antiquity in Palestine."

101. Indeed, the 1951 *Encyclopedia Americana* adds (in its article on 'Prophecy'), that prognosticatory mantic alias false-prophecy "prevailed in Greece [in the Pre-Christian Era]. Specially celebrated was the *Pythia*, the ['Python'] priestess of the Pythian Apollo at Delphi, who spoke in an ecstatic state supposed to be caused by vapors from a chasm in the temple. There were also various sibyls in Greece."

102. Indeed, the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* tells us that the *Corybantes* were "spiritual powers with the same relation to the Asiatic 'Mother of the Gods' as the *Curetes* bear to Zeus...[and] are distinguished...by the more-pronouncedly orgiastic nature of their rites.... They had a mystic cult.... A prominent feature of their ritual, was a wild dance which was claimed to have powers of healing mental disorders.... Originally, they were priests or medicine-men of ancient times."

103. We have already referred (in paragraph 77 above) to the 'blood-baptism' or *taurobolium* used to initiate devotees into the cult of Cybele. The 1929 *Encyclopaedia Britannica* -- in its article 'Taurobolium' -- describes it as "a rite of baptism by bull's blood, usually in connection with the worship of Cybele [*cf.* First Corinthians 12:1-2 & 15:29]....

104. "The person undergoing the ceremony...takes his place in a trench covered by a grating on which a bull is slain..., its date frequently being March 24 -- the *Dies Sanguis* [or 'Bloody Day'] of the annual festival of the 'Great Mother' and Attis.... Its usual motive was the purification or regeneration of an individual -- who was occasionally spoken of as *renatus in aeternum*, reborn for eternity, in consequence of the ceremony. *Corpus Inscriptionum Latinum*, VI:510-12)."

105. Similarly, Rev. Professor Dr. Mathis Rissi, in his First Corinthians 15:29 monograph titled *Baptism for the Dead* (compare First Corinthians 12:2 & 15:29), refers¹⁹ to an "inscription from the year 163 B.C. This reads: 'to the Great Mother...of Apollo's monthly-gift, in the name of Dionysos...when he bathed himself.'" Indeed, Rissi himself remarks that the "heretical interpretation" of First Corinthians 15:29 "is found still later..., in the comments of...the Montanists" from A.D. 150 onward.

106. We have already seen the connection between the ecstatic utterances of Jezebel's pagan devotees to Astarte (First Kings 18:25-29 *cf.* Matt. 6:7- 8), and the pagan Greek sibyls

or pseudo-glossolalic shrine-priestesses (*cf.* Revelation 2:18-21). To refresh one's knowledge, it is suggested one reads again our paragraphs 62-67*f* above.

107. According to the 1929 *Encyclopaedia Britannica* and the 1951 *Encyclopedia Americana*, in their articles under the heading 'sibyl': "The [pagan] Greeks gave the name 'sibyl' to certain women regarded as being inspired by a deity. Even before their mention by Plato and Aristotle, Heracleitos says that the sibyl (or Marpeessos) 'with her maddened mouth...reaches a thousand years with her voice by the power of the god (Apollo).' The great Roman polymath Varro mentions ten sibyls, including one in Phrygia and one in Egypt.

108. "In Egypt, the Alexandrian Jews in the 2nd century B.C. composed the so-called *Sibylline Oracles*. These, seriously attempting to syncretize Sibylla with David -- later found their way to Rome, where they lingered on till 400 A.D." See paragraphs 163*f* & 317*f*.

109. Now both the Pre-Christian as well as the later Post-Montanistic background of Cybele-worship in Phrygia, is well-known. The New Testament itself reflects this. Acts 19:36*f*; First Corinthians 12:2 & 13:1 & 14:7-8 & 15:29; Second Corinthians 6:15-18; and Revelation 2:12-14 & 2:18-21. Indeed, in their various commentaries, leading Christian Theologians clearly allude to the Pre-Christian Cybele-worship background even of Corinth and of Thyatira (in Phrygia).

110. Thus Calvin calls both Pre-Christian and also the later Corinth a multilingual citadel of "bombastic language" and of "chattering speech-makers."²⁰ Albert Barnes says: "Corinth thus became the mart of Asia and Europe.... The principal deity worshipped in the city, was Venus" (*cf.* Aphrodite and Diana and Cybele and Artemis and Astarte). Indeed, even in the time of Christ -- "it was enjoined by law that one thousand beautiful females should officiate as courtesans or public prostitutes 'before the altar of the goddess of love'...obtained by sending to distant countries" -- so that "foreign merchants were attracted in this way to Corinth."²¹

111. This seems to be why Paul later wrote to those Corinthians converted to Christianity from such Paganism: "You were Pagans, carried away unto these dumb idols, just as you were being led" (First Corinthians 12:2). Thus Paul wrote that though one "speak with the tongues of men...but not have true love" -- one has "become like sounding brass or a tinkling cymbal." For such were the mindless ecstatic utterances of their Pre-Christian Cybele-worship at Corinth (First Corinthians 13:1), with its "pipe or harp" and "trumpet" noisiness (14:7-8).

112. Too, this is why Paul warns the Corinthians against the Cybele-*taurobolium* or 'blood-baptism' for the dead. Indeed, some of them too had perhaps previously received such -- in their own Pre-Christian days at Corinth (First Corinthians 15:29).

113. This worship of Cybele, Diana, or Artemis -- was condemned also at Ephesus (*cf.* Acts 19:26-35 with Revelation 2:1-2). Moreover -- the worship of Baal, Astarte and Cybele was condemned even in Pergamos and Thyatira in Phrygia. For the Baal-doctrine of Balaam was strong in Pergamos -- "the seat of Satan" (Revelation 2:12-14 *cf.* Numbers 22:41).

114. Indeed, in Thyatira -- the false teacher "Jezebel, who calls herself a 'Prophetess'" was propagating her ecstatic utterances and her sexual immoralities apparently even within the Christian community! And Thyatira was located precisely where the heresy of Montanism would later flourish -- in Western Asia Minor. Revelation 2:18-21 & 2:12-14 and Second Corinthians 6:15-18, *cf.* paragraphs 62-67*f* above.

115. However, the true tongues-speaking of the Apostolic Church was altogether different to the above-mentioned gobbledygook and pseudo-prophecies of the Pagans! For the true glossolaly was grounded in Adam's pre-fall speech when he as God's image gave very rational names to the other creatures (Genesis 2:19*f cf.* First Corinthians 14:7-10 & 15:45-47). But the false utterances of the later Pagans were and are grounded in the post-fall sudden *staccato* of the serpent, when it misrepresented what God had said (Genesis 3:1*f cf.* First Corinthians 12:1-3 & 14:23 and Second Corinthians 11:3-15).

116. True speech is very heavenly, intelligent, intelligible, clear, and communicative. However -- pseudo-speech is very earthy, ecstatic, inaccurate, confused, and confusing.

117. The Christian charisma was heaven-on-earthly, linguistic, meaningful, miraculous, prophetic, revelatory, and temporary (Acts 2:4-11 and First Corinthians 13:8-13 & 14:5-21). Temporary, because it was predestined to cease -- upon completion of the inscripturation of the last Book of the Bible (Revelation 22:16-18a).

118. But Satan's pseudo-*charismata* are garbled gibberish, pseudo-miraculous, deceptive, non-revelatory, and permanent. Yes, permanent -- in the sense that they sinfully keep on adding to the now-completed Holy Scripture, right down till our present day (James 3:14-16; Second Thessalonians 2:3-12; and Revelation 22:18*bf*).

119. We now turn to the first generation of extant Christian Writers after the Apostles, subsequent to the completion of Holy Scripture with the inspired inscripturation of John's Apocalypse alias the Revelation of Jesus Christ (1:1*f*) as the last book in the Bible. Such are called the 'Apostolic Fathers.' For all of them personally knew the Apostles themselves.

120. Those Apostolic Fathers firmly condemned ecstatic Cybele-worship and other forms of doubled-tongued magic. Thus the (A.D. 50-120) *Didachee* or *Teaching of the Twelve Apostles* states:²² "The Father desires that gifts be given to all, from both temporal as well as spiritual bounties (*ek toon idioon charismatoon*)."

121. The specific gifts then available, were not specified. However, the *Didachee* soon continues against sins of the tongue: "You shall not bear false witness! You shall not speak evil!.... You shall not be...double-tongued! For to be double-tongued is a snare of death. Your speech shall not be false, not empty [*cf.* First Corinthians 13:1 & 14:10-19]....

122. "Do not be an observer of omens, nor an en-charm-er, since it leads the way to idolatry!.... The way of death is...magic arts, witchcrafts..., filthy talking..., boastfulness....

123. "Let every Apostle that comes to you, be received in the Lord.... But if he asks for money, he is a false-prophet [*cf.* many antinomian modern Pentecostal Television

‘Evangelists’].... Not every one that ‘speaks in the Spirit’ [sic!] is a Prophet -- but only if he holds to ‘the ways of the Lord’ [alias the Decalogue]. Therefore, from their ways, shall the false-prophet and the [true] Prophet be known....

124. "Every Prophet proved true...., shall not be judged among you.... But whosoever says ‘in the Spirit’ [sic] ‘Give me money or something else!’ -- you shall not listen to him!" Notwithstanding this, "false-prophets and corrupters shall be multiplied...and shall do ‘signs and wonders!’"

125. The decalogical emphasis here in the *Didachee* on ‘The Two Ways’ -- the ‘Way’ of keeping **God’s Commandments** as opposed to the opposite way of breaking them -- is deadly to the modern pentecostalist way of ignoring the **Regulative Principle of Worship** grounded on the First Table of **the Ten Commandments**. Indeed, God’s ‘Way of Life’ with its implications also for orderly worship is found not only in the *Didachee* -- but also in other extant works of the Apostolic Fathers such as the *First Epistle of Clement* to the Corinthians (compare Philippians 4:3) and the *Epistle of Barnabas* (compare Acts 14:4-14) and the *Shepherd of Hermas* (compare Romans 16:14).

126. For the A.D. 57-97 *First Epistle to the Corinthians* of Clement of Rome too condemns the previous antinomian "**frenzy and disorder**" of some of those Corinthians in their Pre-Christian days of pagan ecstasy.²³ For such was altogether contrary to the **Regulative Principle of Worship** as an efflux of **God’s Decalogue**.

127. Indeed, also the *Epistle of Barnabas*, around 100 A.D., condemns "idolatry" and "deceit" and "magic" and "falsehood" and "evil-speaking" and pseudo-miracles alias false "signs and wonders" -- thus commending the decalogical ‘Way of Light’ and **condemning the opposite antinomian ‘way of darkness.’** For: "You shall not be hasty with your tongue!" and "You shall not be...of double tongue!" There, the *Codex Sinaiticus* has "talkative." Indeed, "you shall not be hasty with your tongue!"²⁴

128. In the A.D. 107f Ignatius of Antioch,²⁵⁴ there is no mention either of faith-healing or of inspired tongues-speaking. Thus, in his *Letter to the Ephesians*, there is just as little mention of glossolalia as there was in the earlier Paul’s inspired *Epistle to the Ephesians* -- or in John’s inspired ‘*Epistle to the Ephesians*’ in Revelation 2:1-7.

129. Indeed, in Ignatius’s *Epistle to the Philadelphians* -- he says he loves the Old Testament "Prophets as those who [past tense] announced Christ...as being partakers of the same Spirit with the Apostles. For just as the false-prophets and the false-apostles drew [to themselves] one and the same wicked...and seducing spirit who deceived people -- so too did [past tense] the Prophets and the Apostles receive from God through Jesus Christ one and the same Holy Spirit.... There is...one Comforter, Who displayed [past tense] His power in Moses and the Prophets and Apostles."

130. The longer version of Ignatius’s *Epistle to Polycarp* interprets Matthew 8:17’s ‘He took our infirmities and bare our sicknesses’ in a most unfaithhealing and unpentecostalist way. For it then immediately goes on to say that "every kind of **wound is not healed** with the same **plaster**" -- and that we should "mitigate attacks [of disease] by

gentle applications [literally: 'lessen attacks of paroxysms by embrocations'].... For...you are composed of both soul and body..., so that you may be lacking in nothing but may abound in every **gift** (*en pantos charismatos*)."

131. The (Syriac-language) *Epistle to the Antiocheans* attributed to Ignatius is addressed "to the Church of God....which has been endowed with mercy -- and then goes on to inculcate various **moral duties**. *Inter alia*, he there states that "as to the practice of magic...or murder, it is superfluous to write to you. Since such vices are forbidden to be committed even by the Heathen."

132. Finally, in Ignatius's or Pseudo-Ignatius's (Syriac) *Epistle to the Philippians* he writes that 'there is also...one Spirit' [Ephesians 4:4] -- since 'we have been called in one hope of our calling' [First Corinthians 12:13]. And again, 'We have drunk of one Spirit' [Ephesians 4:4].... And it is manifest that 'one and the self-same Spirit keeps on working all these gifts'" possessed by believers [First Corinthians 12:11].

133. We shall presently see that the Christian Apologists and Anti-Gnostic Fathers and the Catechetical Schools of Alexandria and Caesarea *etc.* all opposed the heresy of that notorious ex-priest of Cybele known as Montanus of Phrygia. Indeed, the A.D. 150f famous Apologist Justin Martyr²⁶ clearly condemns those "who prostitute even their own children and wives" and who sometimes have them "openly mutilated for the purpose of sodomy" -- when "they refer these 'mysteries'[!] to the 'Mother of the gods'" Cybele.

134. Similarly, Arnobius, in his 298 A.D. work *Against the Heathen* -- strongly condemns the worship of Attis, Bacchus, the Corybantes, Diana, and the 'Great Mother of the gods' Cybele. For this, he says²⁷ -- came from the Phoenicians (*cf.* First Kings.18:19-29) *via* Phrygia (*cf.* Revelation 2:14-21).

135. The worship of Astarte or Cybele started apparently in the Near East -- Mesopotamia, Canaan, Syria and Phoenicia. It was taken by Phoenician seafarers first to Phrygia and then to Africa (at Carthage). Indeed, in his 29f B.C. *Aeneid*, even Virgil refers to the Bacchic nature of Phrygian Cybele-worship, especially in the Phoenician-Phrygian colony of Carthage.²⁸ Moreover, also the later Montanism apparently came even to Tertullian's Carthage -- from the Phoenician colony of Phrygia alias "the home of a sensuously-mystic and dreamy nature religion" (thus Schaff).²⁹

136. Phrygia -- the center of Cybele-worship! Even Montanus's name appears on various Phrygian inscriptions. Who, then, was he?

137. Montanus himself was an adulterous heathen priest of the nature-goddess Cybele.²⁹ Shortly after his profession of conversion to Christianity (perhaps around A.D. 150f), he continued his Pre-Christian ecstatic utterances -- no longer to Cybele, but this time allegedly to 'the Holy Spirit.'

138. Two women, Priscilla (alias Prisca) and Maximilla, then declared themselves to be 'Prophetesses.' Thereupon they left their husbands, and followed Montanus. *Cf.* Revelation 2:18-21! All three of them: opposed infant baptism; asserted the Cybele-rite's

own "baptism for the dead" (*cf.* First Corinthians 15:29); and claimed that they were reviving neglected apostolic gifts, by allegedly performing 'miracles.'

139. Indeed, all three of them also claimed to 'speak in strange tongues.' Moreover, they proclaimed the imminent descent of the 'New Jerusalem' to their headquarters of Pepuza in Phrygia at the beginning of the 'millennium' and before the year 200 A.D.

140. At least the latter soon proved to be a 'false-prophecy' made by 'false-prophets.' Indeed, such a false-prophecy questions the veracity even of their other claims.

141. Like Cybele-worship before it, Montanistic syncretism too spread from one Phoenician colony in Phrygia to another Phoenician (and Phrygian) colony in Carthage. Thus Neander and Renan.³⁰ Further, the Montanists and their leading laywomen advocated Post-Biblical 'inspiration' -- through themselves, as those whom they regarded as 'spiritual' (*sic*)!

142. Indeed, the Montanists condemned the mainline Church -- as clericalistic and carnal. Yet the Church attributed the Montanistic 'revelations' to satanic suggestions.³¹

143. The testimonies of those who eye-witnessed the ecstatic utterances of Montanus and his followers, have carefully been collected and preserved by the Early Church's great Historian Eusebius (324 A.D.). Montanus, writes Eusebius, "became beside himself! Being suddenly in a sort of frenzy and ecstasy, he raved and began to babble and utter strange things...in a manner contrary to the constant custom of the Church handed down by tradition from the beginning.

144. "Some of those who heard his spurious utterances at that time, were indignant.... They rebuked him as one that was possessed and under the control of a demon and led by a deceitful spirit" -- and as one of the "false-prophets."

145. Indeed, "others" of those Montanists, "imagining themselves possessed by the Holy Spirit..., were elated and not a little puffed up.... They were cheated and deceived by him ('the mad and insidious and seducing spirit')....

146. "The devil...secretly excited and inflamed their understanding, which had already become estranged from the true faith. And he stirred up, besides, two women -- and filled them with the false-spirit, so that they talked wildly and unreasonably and strangely."³²

147. Interestingly, some (Neo-)Pentecostals today appeal precisely to Montanus and/or to Montanism as authority for their own carryings-on (*cf.* our endnotes 176-77 below). However, the careful historiography of the Early-Church's great Historian Eusebius of Caesarea surely offers modern Pentecostals nothing but embarrassment -- as too do the extant Anti-Montanist writings of Hermas and Irenaeus and Cyril, *etc.*

148. Miracles last occurred during the Apostolic Age, and ceased during the first century with the completion of the Holy Bible. Daniel 9:24f; First Corinthians 13:8f; Revelation 22:18f. Since then, no group credibly alleging to be Christian ever claimed that miracles still occurred -- until the Montanists.

149. It is quite true that the A.D. 156f heretic Montanus and his fanatical followers claimed to be able to exercise miraculous powers. But this claim was never substantiated, nor conceded to be factually correct by Montanus's consistently-Christian adversaries.

150. In at least one respect, Montanus was very obviously seen to be a false-prophet. For, despite all Montanistic predictions, Christ did not fulfil the indeed-Biblical promise of His second coming -- by visibly descending on the Montanistic capital of Pepuza in Phrygia in the third century A.D. (as Montanism had falsely foretold).

151. Thus the false Montanistic predictions of Christ's soon return during their heyday, did not come to pass. And this non-fulfilment brands them as the false-prophets they indeed were. Cf. Deuteronomy 13:1-9 and 18:20-22!

152. Right after the rise of Montanism in the middle of the first century A.D., we find the Early Church Father Hermas opposing the "false-prophet" who is "impudent and talkative." That, says Hermas,³³ is because the "devil fills him with his own spirit."

153. Similarly, so too the great Christian Apologist Justin Martyr (A.D. 160). He indeed concedes³⁴ that orthodox Christians had in some cases "formerly used magical arts" -- before their conversion to Christ.

154. Yet Justin elsewhere attacks "strange...and deceitful spirits." They are manifestly unconverted. Indeed, they proceed "from the unclean spirit of the devil" -- *via* the paganistic "'prophetic' ecstasy" of those who "know nothing of what they are saying...in a state of frenzy."

155. In his *Dialogue with the Jew Trypho*, Justin says the Disciples receive gifts "each as he is worthy.... For one receives the Spirit of understanding; another, of counsel; another, of strength; another, of healing; another, of foreknowledge; another, of teaching; and another, of the fear of God." Note, none are miraculous!

156. In that same work, Justin later speaks also of "*prophetika charismata*" -- no doubt meaning not foretelling but forthtelling, because he tells Trypho that the gifts "formerly among your nation [with its Old Testament books] have been transferred to us [Christians also with our New Testament books]." But again, Justin says nothing about tongues-speech.

157. Yet Justin tells the Judaist Trypho about the gifts of the Spirit which in fulfilment of Isaiah 11:1f came to rest upon Jesus. He says that the Holy Spirit "rested" or "ceased" when He [*viz.* Christ] came.... It was requisite that these gifts should cease among you [Judaists], and, having come to an end in Him, should again be given...to all His believers. It had been predicted that He would do this after His ascension into Heaven. It was said therefore: 'He ascended on high; He led captivity captive; He gave gifts to the sons of men.'

158. "Now if you look around you, can see among us Christians -- both men and women endowed with gifts from the Spirit of God. Thus, it was not because He needed the powers enumerated by Isaiah that it was foretold that they would come on Him, but only because they would not exist any more afterwards."

159. The A.D. 165 Tatian the Assyrian, writer of the *Diatessaron* alias the first extant 'Harmony of the Gospels' -- while still himself orthodox, condemned those Pagans who "by the intermixture of barbaric words" had made their "language medley." They, he observes, "shout lustily and croak like so many ravens" -- and are misled by "the trickeries of frenzied demons."³⁵

160. Also his contemporary, Melito of Sardis, stood against Montanism.³⁶ So too did the A.D. 170 Theophilus, who warned against "the deceptive fancy" of "an erring spirit" of "demon[s]."

161. Indeed, the A.D. 175 Athenagoras of Athens warns against demons "supposed to utter oracles and to heal the sick." For such demons confuse "delusive...souls" by "taking possession of their thoughts" -- and by filling their minds with "empty visions."³⁸

162. Indeed, all the pronouncements of these early Christian writers -- are to be found between A.D. 130 and 180 A.D. That was during the very heyday of Montanism!

163. Yet even after the death of the ecstatic predecessors and successors of Montanus himself, his movement long continued. So too did orthodox Christianity's opposition to it -- especially through the Early Church Fathers Irenaeus and Caius.

164. As Rev. Professor Dr. A. Cleveland Cox points out in his *Introductory Note to Irenaeus Against Heresies*,³⁹ the A.D. 120 to 202 Church Father "Irenaeus was sent to Rome with letters of remonstrance against the rising pestilence of heresy....

165. "But he had the mortification of finding the Montanist heresy patronized by Eleutherus!... Returning to Lyons..., the emissaries of heresy followed him -- and began to disseminate their licentious practices and foolish doctrine by the aid of 'silly women'" like the Montanistic 'prophetesses' Maximilla and Prisca.

166. Consequently, Irenaeus of Lyons then wrote his great A.D. 185 work *Against Heresies*. There,⁴⁰ he condemns all those post-apostolic people who were alleged to be "working miracles" -- according to their leaders' own "senseless and crack-brained followers." Such people thus condemned, are those alleged to be able "to 'prophesy'" -- when, in fact, only "talking a deal of nonsense."

167. While they themselves were thus "uttering no word of truth" -- continues Irenaeus -- even they themselves "confidently assert...that the sound of this uttering of 'praise' [*sic!*]" is like "the case of infants who have just been born.... Such ravings, we may now well say, go beyond Iu! Iu! Pheu! and every kind of tragic exclamation or utterance.... For who would not detest one who is the wretched contriver of such audacious falsehood?...

168. "Those persons...fall into a fit of frenzy. The more they laugh -- they...are thus shown only to be the more seriously diseased!"³⁹ Forebodings, here, of the infamous Toronto 'Blessing' [?] (*sic!*)!

169. "As I have said," continues Irenaeus, " even the dead have been raised up [**past** tense!], and they remained [**past** tense] among us [Christians] **for many years** [until they finally died].... **It is not possible** to name the number of gifts (*charismata*) which the Church had received [**past** tense]..., **and** [her other gifts] which she exerts day by day" [**present** tense].

170. In the Irenaeian passage above, there is mention only of raising the dead -- but of no miraculous tongues-speaking at all. Either way, however, both gifts were clearly '**past** tense' in the [A.D. 120-202] time of Irenaeus.

171. Irenaeus wrote also several (unfortunately now lost) letters against the Montanist Blastus. Indeed, the same Irenaeus states that the A.D. 155f Montanists "set at nought the gift of the Spirit which in the latter times had [**past** tense!] been...poured out (Acts 2) upon the human race.... Wretched men indeed, who wish to be pseudo-prophets!...

172. "These men (the Montanists) cannot admit the Apostle Paul either. For in his Epistle to the Corinthians [11:4] to 14:-40], he speaks expressly of prophetic gifts.... Sinning therefore...against the Spirit of God [Matthew 12:31], they [the Montanists] fall into the irremissible sin."

173. Certainly there **were** true miracles earlier, during the Apostolic Age! Indeed, continues Irenaeus, "we have heard [*multos audivimus (not audimus!)*] of many brethren in the Church who possess prophetic gifts [*prophetica habentes charismata*] and who through the Spirit speak all kinds of languages [*universis linguis loquentes*] and bring to light for the common benefit the hidden things to men (*cf.* First Corinthians 14:24f) and declare the mysteries of God which also the Apostle terms 'spiritual' [*quos et 'spirituales' Apostolus vocat*]."

174. In this last Irenaeian passage, the gifts of miraculous tongues-speaking and of prophetic gifts are indeed mentioned -- but only in the past tense (*audivimus* alias "we **have** heard" and **not** *audimus* alias "we [still] hear") Yet even there, the tongues-gifts being referred to apparently mean 'all kinds of languages' (*linguis*) -- and not neo-pentecostalist or ecstatic gobbledegook.

175. Also Presbyter Caius of Rome (200 A.D.) refutes Proclus the Neo-Montanist. Indeed, Caius classifies the Montanists as being among the "heretics" -- and proclaims them to be both "infidel" and "demonic."⁴¹

176. It was during the time of Zephyrinus, that Caius wrote his learned refutation of Proclus. Of that refutation -- sadly -- only fragments now remain.

177. Proclus was a defender of that sect of Neo-Montanists known as the Cataphrygians. Maintains the orthodox Caius: "I can show the trophies of the Apostles" -- by which Caius probably means their apostolic writings alias the books of the New Testament.

178. Yet the heretic Proclus, "through 'revelations' given (as he would have us believe) by 'a great Apostle' -- brings before us 'marvellous things' which he pretends were shown to

him by angels." Here, any real resemblance between Proclus and Pentecostalistic self-proclaimed 'Evangelists' viewable on their many modern television shows -- is hardly coincidental!

179. Now this false-prophet and self-proclaimed 'great Apostle' Proclus and his Cataphrygians -- attempted to link their own alleged 'revelations' to the real revelations previously given in the Apostolic Age to the Church. "For," explains Caius, "they say that all those of the first age, and the Apostles themselves, both received and taught those things which these men now maintain.... Perhaps what they allege might be credible -- if the Holy Scriptures, in the first place, did not contradict them!....

180. "Besides, there are writings of certain brethren" also in the Post-Apostolic Church -- which expose such errors. "They wrote against the Heathen, in defence of the truth -- and against the heresies of their time. I mean Justin and...Tatian and...many others."

181. Speaking of the heresy of Montanism in particular, Caius then adds: "The Sacred Scriptures, they have boldly falsified; and the canons of the Ancient Faith, they have rejected.... For either they do not believe that the Divine Scriptures were dictated by the Holy Spirit, and are thus infidels -- or they think themselves wiser than the Holy Spirit....

182. "What are they, then -- but demoniacs?" By this word 'demoniacs' -- Caius apparently means: demon-driven human beings.

183. Some of the Montanists, such as Miltiades, even wrote down their 'revelations' -- claiming a certain authority for those writings. Protests the orthodox Caius: "Of the writings of...Miltiades, we receive nothing at all! Those are rejected too -- [the writings of those] who wrote the new 'Book of Psalms'" (*sic*). Indeed, Caius condemned also Montanus himself -- Montanus, the very pioneer of Montanism and "the founder of the Asian Cataphrygians" in Asia Minor's region of Phrygia.

184. It is sometimes claimed by Pentecostalists and their fellow-travellers that the great Tertullian of Carthage was himself a Montanist. The truth of the matter, however, is that Tertullian lapsed only during the second of his three phases -- and lapsed not into Montanism but merely Semi-Montanism -- before he in his third phase returned to orthodoxy.

185. It is true that Tertullian endorsed of the continuation of many of the charismatic gifts -- in his book *Against Marcion* (V:8). Yet the account in his treatise *On the Soul* (9 cf. 21 & 45) of the sister who had the '*charisma*' of ecstatic revelation -- is spoken of as a 'prophecy' (and not as a 'tongues-speaking').

186. Tertullian, in his mature work *Against the Heresies*, condemned⁴² not only the early Montanists like "Blastus" and "Theodotus" and "Praxeus." He condemned also "other heretics" too, like the "Cata-Phrygians" and also the "Cata-Proclans" (or followers of Proclus the Cata-Phrygian) -- for saying that "the Paraclete had spoken in Montanus."

187. Tertullian did -- according to Augustine⁴³ -- repudiate not just Montanism but, later, also Semi-Montanism. That is believed to have occurred at the time before the more

mature Tertullian then 'anti-ecstatically' went and established a true historic-orthodox Bible-believing fellowship.

188. Against Montanism, also Clement of Alexandria (220 A.D.) insists that the tongues mentioned in First Corinthians 14:9-13 are referring to languages like those of "the Greeks" and "Scythian" *etc.* Indeed, Clement also condemns Montanism as "the heresy of the Phrygians" -- and insists that "the false-prophets" who "prophesied 'in an ecstasy'" were "the servants of the apostate."⁴⁴

189. The great Origen of Alexandria (225 A.D.) writes⁴⁵ that "there were signs" of a non-ecstatic nature "at the beginning of Christ's teaching." Then, "after His ascension" and the Spirit's descent on Pentecost Sunday, those signs became even more amazing -- involving also miraculous tongues-speaking *etc.* Subsequently," however, all such signs became "fewer." Indeed, that was the case -- **even during the Apostolic Era**.

190. "Since [that same A.D. 0-70 generation of] the coming of Christ, no Prophets have arisen.... [Therefore the A.D. 117-180 Anti-Christian Pagan Philosopher] Celsus is not to be believed, when he says he has heard such men 'prophesy'" -- namely such as are "fanatical and utterly unintelligible." For "no Prophets...have appeared in the time of Celsus"⁴⁶ -- only **pseudo-prophets** like Montanus!

191. Origen refutes⁴⁷ the view of the Pagan Celsus that "certain of the 'Christians' are believers in the sibyl" alias false or only so-called 'prophetess' at a pagan shrine. Specifically against the so-called 'prophetesses' 'of Montanism, Origen mentions: "It is not the part of a divine spirit to drive the 'prophet[ess]' into such a state of ecstasy and madness that she loses control of herself.... For he who is under the influence of the Divine Spirit, ought to be the first to receive the beneficial effects.... That should be the time of clearest perception -- when a person is in close intercourse with the Deity....

192. "[Old Testament] Jewish Prophets [all]...became clearer in mind [see Rabbi Professor Dr. A.J. Heschel's 1962 book *The Prophets*].... Never have any of those [such as the later pseudo-miraculous Montanists] who have not embraced our [orthodox-Christian] Faith, done anything approaching what was done by the Ancient Prophets."

193. Exactly the opposite phenomenon was encountered among the pagan 'prophet[esse]s' (*sic*) -- and among the quasi-pagan Montanists! Indeed, continues Origen, "it is said of the Pythian priestess -- whose oracle [at Delphi] seems to have been the most celebrated -- that when she sat down at the mouth of the Castalian cave, the prophetic spirit of Apollo entered her private parts. And when she was filled with it [the false 'prophetic' spirit], she gave utterance to responses which are regarded with awe as divine truths....

194. "The Pythian priestess is beside herself [or out of her mind] when she 'prophesies.' What spirit must that be, which fills her mind and clouds her judgment with darkness -- unless it be of the same order with...**demons!**"

195. Moreover "if we require proofs, the priests of the heathen gods produce many that are 'clear and convincing' -- partly from wonders performed by demons, and partly from the

answers given by oracles and various other modes of divination."⁴⁸ See our paragraphs 323f, for Chrysostom's opinion about the Pythoness (in his comment on First Corinthians 12:2)!

196. The 230 A.D. Christian Apologist Hippolytus of Portus⁴⁹ (in his famous book *Refutation of All Heresies*)⁵⁰ exposes the thoroughly-pagan roots of syncretistic Montanism. The Pre-Montanistic "Phrygians...denominate Corybas" -- the notorious pagan deity -- as the object of their affections and ecstatic tongues-speaking devotions.. "The Phrygians...further assert that the father of the universe is 'Amygdalus'.... Assyrians style thee [*viz.* the pagan divine principle] 'thrice longed-for Adonis'; and the whole of Egypt [calls thee] 'Osiris'.... This is a multiform 'Attis'.... These constantly attend the mysteries called those of the 'Great Mother' [Cybele]." ⁵¹

197. Under Montanism and its syncretistic sects, explains Hippolytus, "these same Phrygians...affirm...[that] Paul the Apostle...ascended as far as the second and third heaven into paradise itself -- and...heard unspeakable words" of ecstasy.⁵² Here, Montanists misinterpret Second Corinthians 12:1-4, which speaks of 'unspeakable words which it is not lawful for man to utter.' Indeed, true intercession by the Holy Spirit rather produces "groanings which cannot be uttered" (Romans 8:26) -- very unlike the highly-audible moanings of the Montanists (and their Neo-Montanistic modern Pentecostalist imitators).

198. The Montanists themselves, continues Hippolytus,⁵³ are "even more heretical...and are Phrygians by birth. These have been rendered victims of error -- from being previously captivated by wretched women called Priscilla and Maximilla, whom they supposed [to be] 'Prophetesses'....

199. "Antecedently to them [Priscilla and Maximilla], they [the Montanists] in like manner consider Montanus as a 'Prophet'.... They are overrun with delusion...

200. "They are heedlessly swept onwards, by the reliance which they placed on these [*viz.* Priscilla and Maximilla and Montanus]. And they allege that they have learned something more through these -- than from the Law and Prophets and the Gospels!.... They magnify these wretched women [Priscilla and Maximilla] above the Apostles!"

201. Indeed, continues Hippolytus, "the Phrygians...derive the principles of their heresy from a certain Montanus and Priscilla and Maximilla -- and regard these wretched women as 'Prophetesses'; and Montanus as a 'Prophet'.... But they are seduced into error, in common with the heretics previously alluded to -- and devote their attention to the discourses of these above the Gospels...

202. "Others of them, being attached to the heresy of Noëtians, entertain similar opinions to those relating to the silly women of the Phrygians -- and to Montanus.... In like manner, also Noëtus [the 'Jesus-only' Sabellian], being by birth a native of Smyrna [near Phrygia]..., [was] addicted to reckless babbling.... The heresy of these has been an occasion of evils to many."⁵⁴ Compare too also the 'Jesus-only' brand of modern Pentecostalists!

203. Writing around 231 A.D., the Early Church Father Asterius Urbanus of Ancyra in Galatia wrote three books against the Montanist Miltiades. Fragments of these have been

preserved in the writings of Eusebius. There, Asterius declares:⁵⁵ "Having now for a very long and surely a very difficult period had the charge pressed upon me...to write some sort of treatise against the heresy that bears the name of Miltiades [the Montanist] -- I have" now done so.⁵⁶

204. To the above word "Miltiades," a later editor (*viz.* the Church Father Nicephorus) adds "*ison d'eipen Montanon.*" This means: 'yet said to be equal to Montanus.'

205. The name of Miltiades rather than that of Montanus, is associated with the heresy specifically of the Cataphrygians. (In the *Muratorian Fragment*, given in the quotation from Caius, we find 'Miltiades' named as being among the heretics.)

206. Explains Asterius:⁵⁷ "[I was] recently...at Ancyra..., and found the church in Pontus greatly agitated by this 'new prophecy' -- as they [the Montanists themselves] call it. But it should rather be called this 'false-prophecy' (as shall be shown presently)... This **new heresy** of theirs, which puts them in a position of separation from the Church, had its origin in the following manner.

207. "There is said to be a certain village...which touches Phrygia. There, they say, one of those who had been but recently 'converted' to the [Christian] Faith, a person by the name of Montanus, ...was carried away in spirit.... Suddenly being seized with a kind of frenzy and ecstasy, he raved and began to speak and to utter strange things....

208. "Among those who were present on that occasion and heard those spurious utterances, there were some who rebuked him as one frenzied and under the power of demons and possessed by the spirit of delusion agitating the multitude. They debarred him from speaking any more. For they were mindful of the Lord's distinction and threatening -- whereby He warned them to be on their guard vigilantly against the false-prophets....

209. "He [Montanus] stirred up two others also -- women. And he filled them with the spurious spirit -- so that they too spoke in a frenzy and unseasonably and in a strange manner, like the person [Montanus] already mentioned, while the spirit called them 'happy' as they 'rejoiced.'" Compare here the 'happy clappies' of Modern Neo-Pentecostalism!

210. Explains Asterius of Ancyra: "Those few who were thus deluded, were Phrygians. But the same arrogant spirit taught them to revile the Church Universal under Heaven -- because that false-spirit of prophecy found neither honor from it nor entrance into it....

211. "The faithful throughout Asia [Minor], met together often -- and in many places of Asia [Minor] -- for deliberation on this subject. They subjected those novel doctrines to examination -- and declared them to be spurious, and rejected them as heretical. They [the Montanists] were, in consequence of that, expelled from the Church."

212. The Montanists, clarifies Asterius,⁵⁸ "stigmatized us as 'slayers of the Prophets' -- because we did not receive their loquacious [self-styled] 'prophets'.... Tell us, O friends, whether there is any one among those who began to speak [thus] from Montanus and the

women onward -- who was persecuted by the Jews or put to death by the wicked [as we orthodox Christians were]? There is not one!...

213. "It is indeed by another kind of death that Montanus and Maximilla are said to have met their end. For the report is, that by the instigation of that maddening spirit, both of them hung themselves....

214. "Theodotus -- that astonishing person who was, so to speak, the first 'procurator' of their so-called prophecy" -- "fell into spurious ecstasies and gave himself wholly over to the spirit of delusion." Theodotus "was at last tossed by him into the air, and met his end miserably.... Montanus and Theodotus and the women mentioned above -- perished....

215. "Whenever those who have been called by the Church unto martyrdom for the True Faith happen to fall in with any of those so-called 'martyrs' of the Phrygian heresy -- they also separate from them.... Because they do not choose to give their assent to the spirit of Montanus and the women....

216. "I found these things in a certain writing of theirs (which the Montanists) directed against the writing of our brother Alcibiades -- in which he proves the impropriety of a Prophet's speaking in ecstasy.... The false-prophet falls into a spurious ecstasy....

217. "But they [the Montanists] will never be able to show that any one of the Old Testament Prophets, or any one of the New, was carried away in spirit after this fashion! Nor will they be able to boast that Agabus, or Judas, or Silas, or the daughters of Philip [Acts 11:27f & 15:32f & 21:8-13]...or indeed any of the others who do not in any respect belong to them, were moved in this way!"

218. It is truly a tragedy that Asterius's three books against the heresy of Montanism have been lost. Yet even from the extant fragments thereof, it is clear that he rightly regarded their frenzied utterances not as the 'wonders' they were claimed to be -- but instead as thoroughly false and spurious.

219. Writing around 250 A.D., Cyprian of Carthage⁵⁹ severely condemned Montanism. In his *Epistles*,⁶⁰ he very firmly insisted: "They who are called 'Cataphrygians' and endeavour to claim to themselves **new** 'prophecies' -- can have neither the Father nor the Son nor the Holy Spirit....

220. "If we ask what Christ they announce, they will reply that they preach Him Who sent the Spirit Who speaks by Montanus and Prisca [*viz.* Priscilla]. And in these, when we observe that there has been not the spirit of truth but of error -- we know that they who maintain their false-propheying against the Christian Faith, cannot have Christ..

221. "I wish to relate to you some facts concerning a circumstance which occurred among us pertaining to this very matter. About twenty-two years ago, in the times after the [earlier Pagan Roman] Emperor Alexander..., there arose among us all of a sudden a certain woman who in a state of ecstasy announced herself as a 'Prophetess' and acted as if filled with the Holy Ghost....

222. "She was so moved by the impetus of the principal demons -- that for a long time she made anxious, and deceived, the brotherhood. She accomplished certain 'wonderful' and 'portentous' things.... A wicked spirit...would also make that woman walk in the keen winter with bare feet over frozen snow, and not to be troubled or hurt in any degree by that walking. Moreover, she would say that she was hurrying to Judea and to Jerusalem!"

223. To Cyprian, then, Montanism was phony and demonic. For there were -- then and there -- in fact no 'new prophecies' at all.

224. The North African orthodox Christian Church Father Arnobius was of the Alexandrian School. Writing around 298 A.D.,⁶¹ he traces the Cataphrygian heresy of Montanism back to the pagan religion of the great 'Mother-Goddess' Cybele.

225. Arnobius rightly says that this religion came from Phoenicia, where Jezebel had served Baal and Astarte ecstatically (*cf.* First Kings 16:31-33 & 18:19-29 with Matthew 6:7) -- *via* the Phoenicians' colony in Phrygia (*cf.* Revelation 2:12-14 and 2:18-21 *etc.*).⁶² Indeed, the Phoenicians subsequently spread this religion yet further, to their other colony at Carthage.

226. Writes Arnobius to his North African countrymen: "Did you not...know the Phrygian 'Mother [of the gods]'? And were you not acquainted with her? And did you not worship her, with remarkable honours? She it is said, was first set up as a goddess by Midas or Dardanus -- when Hannibal the Carthaginian was plundering Italy" (in B.C. 218).

227. "Within...Phrygia...there is a rock of unheard-of wildness in every respect, the name of which is Agdus." It was believed that Themis by her oracle had enjoined that a stone be taken from it and fashioned into the "Great Mother" goddess Cybele. By Jupiter the king of the gods, she was then believed to have been "assailed with lewd desires" upon the rock Agdus. "This the rock received.

228. "Then -- with many 'groanings' -- Ac-destis [or Ag-destis] was born...from his mother rock" Ag-dus. "In him, there had been resistless might and a fierceness of disposition beyond control -- a lust made furious, and derived, from both sexes."⁶³

229. This birth and behaviour of the Phrygian god Ag-destis from the Cybele-rock Ag-dus in Phrygia, was regularly recelebrated. Namely by the Phrygian devotees of "Ac-destis bursting with rage...and frenzied madness."⁶⁴

230. Continues Arnobius in his description of Cybele-worship: "The Phrygians shriek aloud." They are "panic-stricken at the appearance of the gods [during the ceremony]. A daughter of adulterous Gallus cuts off her breasts. Attis snatches the pipe borne [musically] by him who goaded them to frenzy. Indeed, he too, now filled with furious passion -- **raving frantically** and tossed about, **throws himself down** at last -- and, under a pine tree, mutilates himself [*cf.* First Kings 18:19 & 18:28].

231. "With streaming blood, his life flies. But the Great 'Mother of the Gods' [*viz.* Cybele] gathers the parts which had been cut off.... Acdestis joins in with his wailings [*cf.* perhaps the prohibition at Matthew 6:7]. She beats and wounds her breast, pacing round the

trunk of the tree" [cf. First Kings 18:19-28 *etc.*].⁶⁵ The rites included a "seeming frenzy, and the loss of your senses."⁶⁶

232. Arnobius then clearly rejected not just the above-mentioned worship of the pagan so-called 'Mother-Goddess' Cybele. He equally rejected also the attempt of the Montanistic Corybantes to syncretize it with Christianity. Accordingly, Arnobius concludes: "Let the rites of the [Phrygian] Corybantes also be consigned to oblivion!" For these are "also the mysteries into which Phrygia is initiated!"⁶⁷

233. The first great extant Church Historian was Eusebius of Caesarea, who finished writing his famous book *Church History* in 324 A.D.⁶⁸ Therein, he traces also the rise of Montanism from about 156 A.D. onward.

234. Eusebius readily admits that Christ and His Apostles had performed real miracles. But he takes a dim view of Montanists' claims that miracles were still occurring in their heyday during the second half of the second century A.D.

235. Writes the Church Historian Eusebius of Caesarea: "The enemy of God's Church, who is emphatically a hater of good and a lover of evil, and leaves untried no manner of craft against men -- was again active in causing strange heresies to spring up against the Church. For some persons, like venomous reptiles, crawled over Asia and Phrygia -- boasting that Montanus was the Paraclete and that the women that followed him, Priscilla and Maximilla, were prophetesses of Montanus."⁶⁹

236. Eusebius next mentions the opposition to Montanism (and its so-called 'miracles') by the orthodox Christian Theologian Miltiades -- who wrote around 169 to 176 A.D.⁷⁰ This Anti-Montanistic Miltiades must not to be confused with the then-contemporary Montanist of the same name.

237. The orthodox Anti-Montanist Miltiades, observes Eusebius, "wrote a certain book against the above-mentioned heresy"⁷¹ of Montanism -- a book titled *On the Need for a Prophet to Refrain from Ecstasy*. Indeed, "he shows that a '**Prophet**' ought **not to speak in ecstasy** (*mee dein 'Propheeteen' en ekstasei lalein*)."

238. On the other hand, added Eusebius by way of contrast, "the false-prophet falls into ecstasy -- in which he is without shame or fear. Beginning with purposed ignorance, he [then] passes on...to involuntary madness of soul."

239. Yet those Montanists -- observed Eusebius -- "cannot show that [even] one of the Old [Testament] or one of the New [Testament] Prophets was thus 'carried away in spirit.'" Quite the contrary! Daniel 2:24 *cf.* First Corinthians 14:32 *per contra* 12:2 *etc.*

240. Too, Eusebius writes also about the 175 A.D.⁷² orthodox Anti-Montanist Christian Apolinarius of Hierapolis. Explains Eusebius: "A number of works of Apolinarius have been preserved" -- including "those which he...wrote against the heresy of the Phrygians which...came out with its innovations (or *kainotomeetheisees*).

241. "But at that time [that awful heresy of the Phrygians] was...in its incipiency -- since Montanus, with his false-prophetesses, was then laying the foundations of his error.... Against the so-called Phrygian heresy, the Power Who always contends for the truth raised up a strong and invincible weapon -- Apolinarius of Hierapolis."⁷³

242. Indeed, with Apolinarius were also "many other men of ability" (all Anti-Montanists). One of them (says Eusebius)⁷⁴ wrote "a treatise against the heresy...to refute the falsehood" which he found at "Ancyra in Galatia."

243. He found "the Church there greatly agitated by this novelty -- not 'prophecy' as they [the Montanists] call it -- but rather **false-prophecy**." Indeed, "the Presbyters in the place [Ancyra within Galatia] -- our Fellow-Presbyter Zoticus of Otrous also being present -- requested us to leave a record of what had been said against the oppressors of the truth."

244. Eusebius also relates⁷⁵ that "the followers of Montanus, Alcibiades [the Montanist] and Theodotus [the Montanist] in Phrygia -- were now first giving wide circulation to their assumptions regarding prophecy." This occurred in A.D. 175.

245. Writes Eusebius: "As dissension arose concerning them [*viz.* Montanus and Alcibiades and Theodotus], the [**sound**] brethren in Gaul set forth their own prudent and most orthodox judgment in the matter. They published also several epistles from the witnesses that had been put to death among them.

246. "These they sent, while they were still in prison, to the brethren throughout Asia and Phrygia -- and also to Eleutherus, who was then Bishop of Rome -- negotiating for the peace of the churches. The same witnesses also recommended Irenaeus, who was already at that time a Presbyter of the parish of Lyons, to the above-mentioned Bishop of Rome."

247. Consequently, around 177 A.D., those Gallic martyrs exhorted Eleutherus of Rome to confirm the Eastern Church in its condemnation of Montanism.⁷⁶ For the Gauls sent their Irenaeus to Rome, at the beginning of 178 A.D.,⁷⁷ in order to oppose the Montanists in that influential city.

248. Irenaeus's strongly Anti-Montanistic views are well-known.⁷⁸ And Eusebius himself tells us that "Irenaeus wrote several letters against those who were disturbing the sound ordinance of the Church at Rome. One of them (*On Schism*), was to [the Montanist] Blastus."⁷⁹

249. Eusebius adds:⁸⁰ "Priscilla and Maximilla were 'Prophetesses' of Montanus. Others, of whom Florinus was chief, flourished at Rome. He fell from the Presbyterate of the Church. And Blastus was involved in a similar fall. They also drew away many of the Church to their opinion, each striving to introduce his own innovations."

250. Now "Montanus and Maximilla," explains Eusebius⁹¹ -- like many of the Montanists -- came to an ignoble end. "For the report is that, incited by the spirit of frenzy, they both hung themselves."

251. Eusebius concludes on this matter:⁸² "So also, as general reports say, that remarkable person -- 'the first steward' as it were of their so-called 'prophecy' -- [one Theodotus] who...fell into trances and entrusted himself to the deceitful spirit, was pitched like a quoit and died miserably.... In such a manner...Montanus and Theodotus and the above-mentioned woman [Maximilla] died."

252. Yet it is not only the pseudo-miracles of Early-Montanism (before 185 A.D.) that Eusebius opposes. Equally, Eusebius refutes also the pseudo-miracles of Mid-Montanism (from 185 to 200 A.D.).

253. For the great Early Church Historian informs⁸³ his interested readers that also "Rhodo, a native of Asia [Minor], who had been instructed, as he himself states, by [the earlier Anti-Montanist] Tatian,"⁸⁴ wrote "several books. ..against the heresy." [Also the later Jerome of Bethlehem states Rhodo wrote a work *Against the Phrygians*, and condemned the Montanists when writing against Montanus and Prisc(ill)a and Maximilla in his book "to Miltiades [the Anti-Montanist] -- who also [himself] wrote against the same heretics."⁸⁵

254. Then, Eusebius says of Apollonius of Ephesus who strongly opposed Montanism around 190 A.D.: "As the so-called 'Phrygian Heresy' was still flourishing in Phrygia in his time, Apollonius also...undertook its refutation, and wrote a special work against it, correcting in detail the false-prophecies current among them and reproving the life of the founders of the heresy. But hear his own words respecting Montanus!"

255. Eusebius then cites the works of Apollonius against Montanus. "'His actions and his teaching show who this new teacher is. This is he who taught the dissolution of marriage" and "who named Pepuza and Tymion, small towns in Phrygia, 'Jerusalem' (wishing to gather people to them.

256. "He [Apollonius] writes thus concerning Montanus. And a little farther on, he writes as follows concerning his [Montanus's] Prophetesses: 'We show that these first "prophetesses" themselves, as soon as they were "filled with the spirit" [*sic*], abandoned their husbands! How falsely, therefore, they speak -- who call Prisca "virgin"....

257. "And again, a little farther on, he [Apollonius] speaks thus concerning one of their confessors: 'So also Themiso...wrote a certain general epistle to instruct those whose faith was better than his own, [in which epistle he was] contending for "words" of empty sound'. ... This same Apollonius states in the same work that at the time of his writing, it was the fortieth year since Montanus had begun his pretended prophecy. And he says also that [the orthodox] Zoticus..., when Maximilla was pretending to 'prophecy' in Pepuza, resisted her and endeavoured to refute the spirit that was working in her."

258. Around 192 A.D.,⁸⁶ Serapion strongly opposed Montanism. Explains Eusebius: "Serapion...Bishop of the Church of Antioch mentions the works of Apolinarius [of Hierapolis],⁸⁷ against the above-mentioned heresy [of Montanism]. And he [Serapion] alludes to him [Montanus] in a private letter...in which he himself [Serapion] exposes the same heresy [of Montanism]."

259. In that private letter, Serapion then added [to Apolinarius's Anti-Montanistic works] the following relevant words: "So that you may see that the doings of this lying band of the 'new "prophecy"' so-called, are an abomination to all the brotherhood throughout the World -- I have sent you writings of the most blessed Claudius Apolinarius, Bishop of Hierapolis in Asia [Minor]."

260. Explains Eusebius: "In the same letter of Serapion, the signatures of several Bishops are found. One of them subscribes himself as follows: 'I, Aurelius Cyrenius, a witness, pray for your health!'"

261. Finally, in another letter of Serapion, mention is made of a statement by the Church Overseer Aelius. The latter wrote: "Aelius Publius Julius, [the orthodox] Bishop of Debelum, a colony of Thrace. As God lives in the Heavens -- the blessed Sotas in Ancialus desired to cast out the demon from Priscilla" the Montanist.⁸⁸

262. Clearly, the orthodoxly-Christian contemporaries of the Mid-Montanists certainly expected Christians to get sick. That is why they advocated that there be prayers to God that He might then be pleased to effect their healing. But they did not pray for, nor ever expect to experience, miracles of healing.

263. To the contrary. They ridiculed the Montanistic claims that miracles were occurring. Indeed, they regarded all such real occurrences as demonic -- and the character of such occurrences as only pseudo-miraculous.

264. Now it was probably Proclus who introduced Montanism into Rome at the beginning of the third century.⁸⁹ "Proclus," explains Eusebius, "contended for the Phrygian heresy."⁹⁰ Indeed, he did not hesitate to bend the Scriptures to further his own Montanism.

265. Hence Eusebius observes: "We have thus set forth in these pages what has come to our knowledge concerning the Apostles themselves and the Apostolic Age, and concerning the Sacred Writings which they have left us. As well as concerning...those [Montanistic writings] that are altogether rejected and are out of harmony with apostolic orthodoxy."⁹¹

266. Here, the orthodox Christianity of Luke and the Judean Apostles is seen to be rather strongly at variance with the heretical syncretism of the Phrygian Montanists a century later. For Eusebius asserts⁹² that "Luke, in the Acts of the Apostles, mentions the daughters of Philip who were in that time at Caesarea in Judea with their father [Acts 8:5-13 & 8:40 *cf.* 21:8 *etc.*]."

267. However, continues Eusebius:⁹³ "Proclus...speaks, concerning the death of Philip and his daughters [*cf.* Acts 21:8*f*], as follows: 'After him, there were four prophetesses, the daughters of Philip, at Hierapolis in Asia [Minor]. Their tomb is there [in Phrygia], and the tomb of their father'.... Such is his [Proclus's] statement!

268. "We have thus set forth in these pages what has come to our knowledge concerning the Apostles themselves and the Apostolic Age, and concerning the Sacred Writings [of infallible Holy Scripture] which they have left us." Indeed, we have set forth

also "what has come to our knowledge...concerning...those [fallible and uninspired later Montanistic writings] that are altogether rejected and are out of harmony with apostolic orthodoxy."

269. Too, it is evident from the orthodox Christian Caius's *Muratorian Canon* itself that the Montanistic claims⁹⁴ as to ongoing revelations -- had caused the orthodox Christian Church to react. This it did, by then definitively recognizing the previously-established Apostolic Canon of the Holy Scriptures.

270. As Eusebius explains,⁹⁵ Proclus the Montanist was opposed strongly by the orthodox Christian Presbyter Caius of Rome. "There has reached us also," states Eusebius, "a dialogue of Caius, a very learned man -- with Proclus, who contended for the Phrygian heresy. This was held at Rome under Sephyrinus."

271. Eusebius also quotes at length (and approvingly) both from a friend of the 175 A.D. Anti-Montanist Apolinarius of Hierapolis,⁹⁶ as well as from the 231 A.D. Anti-Montanist Asterius Urbanus.⁹⁷ According to the latter, the Montanistic 'prophetess' Maximilla had herself said: "I am driven away like a wolf from the sheep.... I am word and spirit and power!"

272. Eusebius then adds⁹⁸ that the Montanistic 'spirit of Maximilla' referred to by Asterius Urbanus,⁹⁹ was in the grip a "talkative spirit." Neo-Pentecostalism, here we come!

273. Then, elucidates Eusebius, "in the same work -- after saying other things in refutation of the false 'prophecies' of Maximilla -- he [Asterius Urbanus] indicates the time when he wrote these accounts. He mentions her 'predictions' in which she 'prophesied' [imminent] wars and anarchy.

274. Their falsehood, he [Asterius Urbanus] censures in the following manner: 'And has not this been shown, clearly, to be false? For it is today more than thirteen years since the woman died, and there has been neither a partial nor general war in the World; but rather, through the mercy of God, continued peace even to the Christians!'" And that, despite the fact that the Roman Empire was then still under Pagan Emperors.

275. The great Trinitarian Theologian Athanasius of Alexandria condemned not just the Arians but also the Montanists as heretics. Regarding the latter in particular, he had precisely the following to say:

276. "While all of us [who profess to follow Jesus] are...called 'Christians' after Christ -- Marcion broached a heresy.... Valentinus also.... And others, Cataphrygians from Phrygia.... Manichees and Phrygians...are heretics.... See to it, lest, being familiar with error -- you err in the trespass of the Phrygians who says that the Prophets and the other Ministers of the Word know neither what they do, nor concerning what they announce!"¹⁰⁰

277. Elsewhere, Athanasius speaks of the Montanists as "making a fresh beginning of Christianity.... They were the first heretics who professed to prophesy and to introduce a new or additional revelation."¹⁰¹

278. Explains Athanasius¹⁰² of some heretics who were his contemporaries: "They fall, before they know it, into the extravagance of the Phrygians. They say, with them -- 'To us, first, was revealed'; and 'from us dates the Faith of Christians!' And as those [earlier heretics] inscribe it with the names of Maximilla and Montanus -- so do these [later heretics] inscribe it around A.D. 330^f with the name of]... 'Constantius'" *etc.*¹⁰³

279. Cyril of Jerusalem, writing around 350 A.D., states¹⁰⁴ in his *Catechetical Lectures*: "Let the Cataphrygians also be your abhorrence; and Montanus, their ringleader in evil; and his two so-called 'prophetesses' Maximilla and Priscilla! For this Montanus...was out of his mind, and really mad...

280. "He [Montanus was a] miserable man, and filled with all uncleanness and lasciviousness... Having taken possession of Pepuza, a very small hamlet of Phrygia, he falsely named it 'Jerusalem.'" Indeed, he then predicted that Christ would soon 'return' to that hamlet!

281, Furthermore, continues Cyril, Montanus allegedly "cut the throats of wretched little children and chopped them up into unholy food -- for the purpose of their so-called 'mysteries.' This is why till but lately, in the time of persecution, we [orthodox] were suspected [by unbelievers] of doing this -- because these Montanists were called, falsely indeed, by the common name of 'Christians.' Yet he [Montanus] dared to call himself the Holy Ghost, filled as he was with all impiety and inhuman cruelty."

To Cyril, also the Montanistic claim to be able to perform miracles -- was alarming. Said Cyril, Satan alias "the father of falsehood will make a show of the works of falsehood -- so that the multitudes may think that they see a dead man raised and lame men walking and blind men seeing, when the cure has not been wrought." Indeed, "in the time of Antichrist" -- *cf.* the mediaeval Papacy -- the latter shall "pretend to raise the dead" and "make false shows of signs and wonders."¹⁰⁵

282. Gregory Nazianzen of Constantinople around A.D. 370 admitted¹⁰⁶ that the Spirit of God the Father and the Son is the "creating Power of every reasonable soul [*cf.* Job 32:8]. For in Him we live and move and have our being (Acts 17:28), according to the double power of that Breathing into us. For we were all inbreathed by Him with breath (Genesis 2:7) -- and as many of us as were capable of it, and in so far as we open the mouth of our mind, with God the Holy Ghost."

283. Accordingly, Gregory strongly warns against pseudo-charismatic and unreasonable Montanism. He writes¹⁰⁷ that our "first wisdom -- is to despise that 'wisdom' which consists of language and figures of speech, and spurious and unnecessary embellishments."

284. Gregory repudiates the pagan roots of Montanism. Then he adds: "Nor are we concerned with Phrygian mutilations and flutes and Corybantes, and all the ravings of men...consecrating people to the 'Mother of the Gods' -- as these.... Nor the babbings of the Dodonaean Oak, nor the trickeries of the Delphian tripod, nor the 'prophetic' draught of Castalia"¹⁰⁸ -- compare First Corinthians 12:1-3^f and Galatians 5:12-21!

285. The Corybantes were the Phrygian officers serving the goddess Cybele -- earlier worshipped by Jezebel's false-prophets ecstatically on Mount Carmel -- who performed wild orgies at her worship. Galatians 5:12 -- "I would that those who trouble you, were even cut off!" -- is believed to be an allusion to this practice. It is condemned by Jerome, Ambrose, and Thomas Aquinas.¹⁰⁹

286. Accordingly, Gregory Nazianzen concludes even regarding Montanism alias the Cataphrygian heresy -- that the true flock of Christ's sheep "will flee...from Montanus's evil and feminine spirit."¹¹⁰ So too all the Post-Nicene Fathers -- right down till the advent of modern Pentecostalism. Neo-Pentecostalists -- note well!

287. Basil of Caesarea was a contemporary of Gregory of Nazianzen. Basil too condemns the heresy of the Montanists in their headquarters at Pepuza in Phrygia.

288. He insists that "instances of heresy are those of the Manichaeans...and of these **Pepuzenes**. For with them, there comes in at once their disagreement concerning the actual faith in God....

289. "Now the *Pepuzeni* [a sub-trinitarian sect within Montanism which itself rejected baptism in the Name of the Triune God] are plainly heretical. For, by unlawfully and shamefully applying to Montanus and Priscilla the title of the Paraclete -- they have blasphemed against the Holy Ghost. They are, therefore, to be condemned, for ascribing divinity to men; and for outraging the Holy Ghost by comparing Him to men....

290. "What ground is there, then, for the acceptance of the baptism of men baptized [*sic!*] 'into [the Name of] the Father, and the Son, and **Montanus or Priscilla**?' For those who have not been baptized into the Names delivered to us [from Matthew 28:19's Divine Names of the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit] -- have not been baptized at all!"¹¹¹

291. In more than one of his famous *Prefaces*, Jerome of Bethlehem (345-419 A.D.) condemned ecstatic speech where the speaker quite literally did not know what he was talking about. Thus, of the True Prophet Nahum, Jerome insists that **a True Prophet "speaks not in ecstasy -- such as Montanus, Priscilla, and Maximilla rave.**"¹¹²

292. Now Jerome also refers to "Apollinarius Bishop of Hierapolis in Asia [Minor]" near Phrygia⁹⁷ -- Apollinarius, who died before A.D. 180. He, says Jerome, had authored a book "*Against the Cataphrygians* -- written at the time when Montanus was making a beginning with Priscilla and Maximilla."¹¹³

293. Next, explains Jerome,¹¹⁴ "Irenaeus [who flourished around A.D. 185]...wrote five books *Against Heresies* -- and...a book of *Various Treatises*." Some of the latter were written also to [and against the Montanist] **Blastus** [and further at least one against and] to **Florinus** the Montanist.

294. Similarly, adds Jerome,¹¹⁵ "Rhodo, a native of Asia [Minor], instructed in the Scriptures at Rome by [the Anti-Montanist] Tatian, published...a notable work *Against the Phrygians*." That occurred around 186 A.D.

295. Then, continues Jerome of Bethlehem,¹¹⁶ there was -- around A.D. 180 to 190 -- the Anti-Montanistic "Miltiades." Of him, "Rhodo gives an account -- in the work which he wrote **against Montanus [and] Priscilla and Maximilla.**" For that Rhodo "wrote a considerable volume against these same persons."

296. Jerome is lengthier in his description of the Anti-Montanist Apollonius. The latter flourished around 210 A.D.

297. Jerome records¹¹⁷ that "Apollonius, an exceedingly talented man, wrote a notable and lengthy volume **against Montanus**, Priscilla and Maximilla. There, he asserts that Montanus and his mad 'prophetesses' died by hanging -- and many other things." Among such are the following, concerning Montanus and Prisca and Maximilla...

297. "Let them confess that those who do accept **gifts** -- are not Prophets (*cf.* Acts 8:18-20)! And I will prove, by a thousand witnesses, that they [the Montanists] have received gifts....

298. "'Tell me, does a Prophet dye his hair [like Montanus]? Does a Prophet[ess] stain her eyelids with antimony [like the false-prophetesses Jezebel and Priscilla or Maximilla, *cf.* Second Kings 9:30]? Is a Prophet adorned with fine garments and precious stones?... It will be my task to prove that they [the Montanists] do these things.' He [Apollinarius] says in the same book that the time when he wrote the work, was the fortieth after the beginning of the heresy of the Cataphrygians."¹¹⁸

299. Apollonius, continues Jerome, "says in the same book that the time when he wrote the work -- was the fortieth year after the beginning of the **heresy of the Cataphrygians.**" This means Jerome dates "the beginning of **that heresy**" as being hardly earlier than A.D. 170 -- alias fully a century after the completion of the Holy Scriptures and the cessation of true miracles during the apostolic age.

300. Similarly, Jerome records that the A.D. 199 to 211 orthodox Antiochan Bishop "Serapion wrote...on the heresy of Montanus." In his writing, Serapion exposed "the madness of this **false-doctrine...of a new prophecy**...reprobated by all the World."¹⁰²

301. Too, Jerome refers also to Caius or "Gaius Bishop of Rome" (till 217 A.D.). Caius, says Jerome, had "delivered a very notable disputation Against Proclus the follower of Montanus. There, explains Jerome, Caius was "convicting him [Proclus] of tenuity -- in his defense of the 'new prophecy.'" ¹²⁰

302. In light of the above, Jerome's 385 A.D. *Letter 41* takes on added importance. For there he records his own advice to the Christian woman Marcella, who was right then being plagued by Montanists.

303. Writes Jerome to Marcella:¹²¹ "A certain devotee of Montanus has assailed you with passages in which our Saviour promises that He will go to the Father and that He will send the Paraclete [John 14:28 & 15:26]." That, claimed the Montanist, suggested a series of comings of the Paraclete -- also to Montanus and his 'prophetesses.'

304. To this, Jerome replies: "The Acts of the Apostles inform us both for what time the promises were made, and at what time they were actually fulfilled. We are told ten days had elapsed from the Lord's ascension and fifty from His resurrection -- when the Holy Spirit came down and the tongues...were cloven so that each spoke every language [Acts 2:14-18].... The Apostle Peter...said that the prophecy and promise of the Lord were then and there fulfilled [*cf.* Too Acts 11:15].

305. "How can we claim another fulfillment for ourselves? If the Montanists reply that Philip's four daughters prophesied at a later date [Acts 21:9]; and that a Prophet is mentioned named Agabus [Acts 11:28 & 21:10-11]; and that Prophets as well as Apostles [and] Teachers and others are spoken about in the partition [or imparting to believers] of the Spirit [First Corinthians 12:28 *cf.* Ephesians 4:11]; and that Paul himself prophesied many things concerning heresies still-future, and the end of the world -- we [orthodox Christians] tell them [the Montanists] that we...[now] refuse to receive 'prophets' whose utterances fail to accord with **The Scriptures Old and New.**"¹²²

306. Jerome concludes: "We differ from the Montanists regarding the rule of faith. We distinguish the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit.... We, while we do not encourage them, allow second marriages -- since Paul bids the younger widows to marry [First Timothy 5:14]. They [the Montanists] suppose a repetition of marriage, a sin.... They [also] put the 'Patriarchs' of Pepuza [*sic*] in Phrygia!...

307. "I must confute the open blasphemy of men who say [dispensationistically] that God in the Old Testament first determined to save the World by Moses and the Prophets -- but that finding Himself unable to fulfil His purpose, He took to Himself a body of the virgin and...last of all descended by the Holy Spirit upon Montanus and those demented women Prisca and Maximilla.... To expose the infidelity of the Montanists, is to triumph over it."¹²³

308. As Jerome says also in other writings: "Montanus, that mouthpiece of an unclean spirit, used two rich and high-born ladies Prisca and Maximilla first to bribe and then to pervert many churches. Heretics maintain that the Paraclete came into Montanus.... May Montanus and his madwomen perish!"¹²⁴

309. Augustine of Hippo-Regius was a contemporary of Jerome, and flourished at the end of the fourth century. Like Jerome, Augustine too condemns "the heretical doctrines of the Montanists" and their pseudo-miracles.

310. He did this,¹²⁵ in his A.D. 428-30 work titled *On the Heresies*. His extensive treatment of the cessation of true miracles, yet the ongoing occurrence of many demonic pseudo-miracles, will be presented only elsewhere.¹²⁶ Here, however, the following few brief though relevant quotations will suffice.

311. "In the earliest time," says Augustine about the Apostolic Age,¹²⁷ believers at that time "spake with tongues" miraculously. But "it passed away" -- because "the witness of the presence of the Holy Ghost is not now given through these miracles."

312. Accordingly, "these things do **not** take place **now**.... Who expects, in these days, that those on whom hands are laid...should forthwith begin to speak with tongues?"¹²⁸

313. Indeed, "miracles have **not** been allowed to **continue** to our times."¹²⁹ May "the Lord put us on guard against...‘wonder-workers’ [*sic*]!"¹³⁰

314. The fact is that "those who are baptized, do not **now** receive the Spirit at the imposition of hands so as to speak in the tongues of all the peoples. The sick are **not** [**now** being] healed by the shadow of the preachers of Christ falling on them as they pass by [Acts 5:12-16]. And such other things as were done then, have manifestly **now** ceased."¹³¹

315. So "let no man tell you **fables**, then!" Fables such as: "'Pontius wrought a **miracle!**' and 'Donatus prayed, and God answered him from Heaven [with a miracle]!'"

316. Why not? Because, explains Augustine, those who tell such fables -- "are either **deceived**; or they **deceive**. Against those whom I may call ‘marvel-workers’ [*sic*] -- my God has put me on my guard, saying: 'In the last times there shall arise false-prophets, doing "signs" and "wonders" in order to lead even the elect into error -- if it were possible.'" ¹³² So "why should it be hard for the devil and his angels to make out of corporeal elements, through their own aerial bodies, things at which the flesh marvels -- or even by hidden inspirations to contrive appearances to the deluding of men's senses, whereby to deceive them into frenzy?"¹³³

317. Writing around 400 A.D., John Chrysostom of Constantinople wrote the first ever still-extant *Homilies on First Corinthians*. There, he gives¹³⁴ us the following very valuable comment on the opening verses of First Corinthians chapter twelve:

318. "This whole place is very obscure. But the obscurity is produced by our ignorance of the facts referred to, and by their **cessation** -- being such as then **used** to occur, but **now** no longer take place....

319. "There were...in the place [of first-century A.D. Corinth] many 'soothsayers'" alias pagan false-prophets. In point of fact, "the city was more than usually addicted to Grecian customs" -- to local heathen practices -- than were most other parts of the Ancient Hellenic World.

320. Around A.D. 51f, Paul had reminded the Ex-Pagan Christians in Corinth: 'You know that when you were Heathen, you were led away to those dumb idols.' Now, comments John Chrysostom of Constantinople some 350 years later, what Paul "means -- is this: 'In the idol-temples...if any were at any time possessed by an unclean spirit and began to "soothsay" [alias to utter alleged prognostications] -- he was dragged into chains by that spirit, knowing nothing about the things he uttered.'

321. "For it is peculiar to the 'soothsayer' [ecstatically] to be "beside himself" [manteoon 'idion 'to exesteekenai']; to be under compulsion; to be pushed; to be dragged; to be haled as a madman. But the Prophet [was] not so! He uttered all things with sober mind and composed temper, and he **knew** what he was **saying**." Cf. First Corinthians 14:29-33.

322. "Distinguish the 'soothsayer' and the Prophet!... Hear, for example, Plato¹³⁵ saying thus: 'Even as...the soothsayers say many...things; but know nothing about what they are uttering.'

323. Now the Pre-Christian ecstatic soothsayers at Corinth were quite similar to the 'Pythoness' -- alias the oracular false-prophetess at Delphi. "The Pythoness too," continues Chrysostom, "is said, being a female, to sit at times astride upon the tripod of Apollo.

324. "Thus, the evil spirit ascending from beneath and entering the lower part of her body, fills the woman with madness. Then she with dishevelled hair begins to play the bacchanal and to foam at the mouth, and thus, being in a frenzy, to utter the words of her madness....

325. "These, then, and all such things, Paul was bringing forward when he said: 'You know that when you were Heathen, you were led away to those dumb idols.'" First Corinthians 12:2.

326. On the other hand, states Chrysostom, true "prophecy was exercised...with understanding -- and with entire freedom. Therefore, you see, the [the **True Prophets**] had power either to speak, or to refrain from speaking [*cf.* First Corinthians 14:29-33].... Jonah fled [Jonah 1:3].... Ezekiel delayed [Ezekiel 3:15].... Jeremiah excused himself [Jeremiah 1:6].... God does not thrust them on by compulsion....

327. "For to cause distraction and madness and great darkness -- is the proper work of a **demon**. But it is **God's** work to illuminate -- and, with consideration, to teach things needful. This, then, is the first difference between a soothsayer and a Prophet."

328. Indeed, that is why Chrysostom went on at First Corinthians 12:10 also to differentiate respectively between the 'gift of tongues' and the different 'gift of interpretation of tongues.' Here, he says that "one person knew what he himself spoke, but was unable to interpret; while another had acquired both these, or the other of the two" different gifts.

329. Contemporary to Augustine and Chrysostom, the noted Church Father Epiphanius of Salamis (who died about 403 A.D.) champions the 'True Prophecy' of earlier times (terminating at the end of the Apostolic Age) -- against later Montanism. Writes Epiphanius in his work *Against the Montanistic Heresy* -- contrary to Montanism, in the Holy Bible "the Prophets spake with understanding when uttering that to which they paid close attention."¹³⁶

330. Epiphanius further insists in his very valuable work on (and against) *Heresies*¹³⁷ that the Post-Biblical and truly the only allegedly-Christian and uncomprehending ecstatic false-prophet Montanus and his allegedly-Christian successors began their allegedly-prophetic utterances no earlier than "in the nineteenth year of Emperor Antoninus Pius" alias the year 156-57 A.D. This was thus not a Biblical but a Post-Biblical (and moreover an Un-Biblical) happening!

331. Indeed, during the preceding interval of many decades between the completion of the Holy Bible and the advent of Montanism, nobody professing to be a Christian had claimed

to have witnessed even one single ongoing miracle -- or to have believed that anybody anywhere on Earth was then performing any. Moreover, Epiphanius insists that -- quite unlike the Montanists -- "whatever the [Biblical] Prophets have said, they spoke with understanding."

332. However, writes Epiphanius, many decades after the completing of the Holy Bible -- "the heresy called 'Phrygian' began to blossom..... The Phrygians proclaimed Montanus to be a 'Prophet' -- together with the 'Prophetesses' Priscilla and Maximilla -- whose understanding departed from the right way....

333. "They separated themselves from the fellowship of the Church Universal, following errant spirits and doctrines of demons. 'For we,' they said [both to themselves and to others], 'ought to receive the [earlier-terminated] charismatic gifts!'....

334. "Yet," continues Epiphanius, "the Apostle John warns us in his Epistles [First John 4:1 cf. 2:18f]: 'Test the spirits [to see] if they are from God!' And again: 'You have heard that antichrist comes; and the antichrists are already many. They went out from us; but they were not of us'....

335. "Therefore, they are truly not from the flock of the saints. For from them [the saints], the authors...of error and of mythology [*viz.* the Montanists] have withdrawn in their own contentiousness. And they have grouped themselves together as a sect.

336. Epiphanius resumes:¹³⁸ "But look, even from this particular [Montanistic] viewpoint, those who are being influenced -- are not able to maintain and to strengthen even their own contentious position. For if charismatic gifts are still to be received -- how is it that, [some time] after Montanus and Priscilla and Maximilla, they [the Montanists] have no further 'prophets'?"

337. "Has the *charisma* then been exhausted?... Is grace seen to have been extinguished?... They are "sent not by the Holy Spirit, but by demons of error...to deceive their listeners...by lying.... They err most vehemently....

338. "For whenever...a work was done by True Prophets and by instigation of the True Spirit -- most holy men gave all their responses and oracles and all that they said, with a firm mind and with intelligence.... With a rational faith, they were filled by the Spirit Himself unto a common usefulness.... However, are not these [Montanists], instead -- those of whom the Lord spoke [at Matthew 7:13, warning]: 'Beware of false-prophets who will come to you in sheep's clothing, but who within are rapacious wolves?"

339. Epiphanius continues:¹³⁹ "The voice [of the True Prophet] is never indicated in a perturbed mind! Thus the holy Prophet Ezekiel [4:12f] responded not ecstatically...but with a still, robust spirit. Now these things were truly spoken by Prophets who stood firmly in the Holy Spirit, and who retained both their own mind as well as the faculty of teaching and discerning. For was Daniel [2:27f] himself not found to be full of all wisdom? And did his mind, when he solved Nebuchadnezzar's riddles, not seem to be comprehending clearly?"

340. However, as regards the Montanists: "These are to the contrary. They throw themselves into making 'predictions' which are never certain...[and they] do not speak intelligently. Instead -- their words are oblique and perplexing; and none of them are right."

341. Epiphanius also cites¹⁴⁰ a notorious statement indeed uttered by Montanus -- or perhaps we must rather say, by an evil spirit speaking through Montanus. For the statement was made by a very alien spirit within Montanus -- when the latter was in one of his trances.

342. "Runs the statement [of that alien spirit speaking through Montanus]: "Behold, man is like a harp; but I sweep over him like a *plectrum*! The man is 'asleep'; but I am awake! Behold, it is the Lord Who puts men's hearts outside of themselves (*Ho ek-stanoon*)" -- causing 'ec-stasy' -- "and Who gives [new] hearts to men" so that they can 'prophesy' *etc.*

343. We ourselves cannot but think here -- of the modern equivalent of this alien spirit sweeping over man like a *plectrum*. We mean the spirit sweeping through the guitarists on the stage at Evanjellyfish Rock Concerts and 'Celebration Rallies' [*sic!*] -- as they whip up their audiences to 'get high' on that same spirit.

344. These words of Montanus, Epiphanius goes on, "are the words of a raging madman" (*ekstatikou rheemata*) -- and they are not to be followed! For a different character is discerned in them -- than in the genuine words of the Holy Spirit Himself, which words were seen and spoken formerly through the [True] Prophets....

346. "It is true, as the Montanists themselves point out, that Scripture says 'God caused a deep sleep to fall upon Adam -- so that he slept.'" Genesis 2:21. Yet the sleeping Adam was even then "not insane in mind.... Ec-stasy [however,] is said to be in-sanity' because the soul is said to 'stand outside' (*ek-steenai*) -- that is, to drift away.

347. "But Adam's deep sleep occurred in a different way.... It occurred very differently to that of a madman or a fanatic -- who, while awake, perpetrates certain atrocities in body and in soul.... For he does not know what he says or does -- since he has 'fallen away' from a rational state into one of fury."

348. So too, Epiphanius demonstrates¹⁴¹ that 'truly prophetic' verses -- like Genesis 15:13 & Psalm 115:11 & Acts 1:11 & 10:5-14 & 21:11 & Hebrews 12:21 -- all "show that when the Spirit is said to have spoken in the Prophets, He communicated to them the highest matters of divine recognition and the hidden things of accurate knowledge.... All these words were pronounced by the Prophets, and they were all offered with the mind present -- and with the reason both certain and prudent....

349. "They did not see things mindlessly and furiously. But they themselves heard things with composure -- with the complete judgment of their soul."

350. On the other hand, concludes Epiphanius,¹⁴² among the Montanists alias the false "Phrygians, female 'prophetesses' proclaim in public [contrary to First Corinthians 14:34f & First Timothy 2:11 *etc.*]. Very frequently, in their churches, 'seven virgins' enter...in order to 'prophesy' to the people. They then manifest a certain fury (*enthousiasmou*) to the people

present -- deceiving them with trickery [cf. Revelation 2:20f], and provoking them to weeping. For they even pour forth tears" -- '**sobbing** in the **Spirit**' [sic]!....

351. "Among **them**, women are bishops and elders [*per contra* First Timothy 2:11 to 3:5].... However, these people have truly and at once gone astray from sincere religion, ridiculously and perturbedly.... Various kinds of furies and of demons rise up to press into the[ir] bodies.... They produce insanity." Compare the jazzy and jivy "Jump for Jesus" jingles and jitterbugging of many modern (Neo-)Pentecostals!

352. "They [the Montanists] ignore the command of the Apostles: 'I do not permit a woman to speak' [First Corinthians 14:34], or 'to have authority over men' [First Timothy 2:12]. 'For the man is not from the woman, but the woman is from the man' [First Corinthians 11:8]. And 'Adam was not deceived, but Eve was first deceived and she transgressed' [First Timothy 2:14]. O -- what a vain and manifold error of this world!" Thus Epiphanius.

353. Truly, the distance from the Montanists' Maximilla to the Pentecostals' Aimee Semple McPherson -- is not all that great! Nor is the distance from the Monanists' harp and *plectrum* -- to the twanging guitars of Melodyland and its whimsy 'hymnody'!

354. But even more importantly. The uninspired spoutings-forth of Pentecost Pundits are a far cry from the solemn sermons of Peter and Paul and the Puritans. For the latter, both in their Psalmody and in their Preachings, could settle for nothing less than both the plenary jot-and-tittle exposition of the written Word of God -- as well as the maintenance of the Regulative Principle of Worship as its inevitable and concomitant fruit.

355. In the era of Epiphanius, already in A.D. 381 the First Council of Constantinople had decreed for the orthodox Church "to regard Montanists...as Heathen."¹⁴³ And also Socrates Scholasticus, in his 439 A.D.¹⁴⁴ work *Ecclesiastical History*¹⁴⁵ -- while discussing "Maximilla and Montanus" and the (Trinity-denying 'Jesus-only' Unitarian) "Sabellius and Montanus"¹⁴⁶ and when calling them "blasphemers" -- condemns "the extravagant assumption of the Cataphrygians for asserting as they did that 'the Christian Faith was first revealed to us and commenced with us [**Montanists**].'"

356. Vincent of Lerinum too, around 440 A.D.,¹⁴⁷ insists¹⁴⁸ that "the novel furies of Montanus which arose in the Church" -- as well as "those mad fantasies of new doctrine dreamed up by mad women to be true 'prophecies'" -- were "contrary to the injunction of Moses, where he warned against precisely such false-prophets." See Deuteronomy 13:1-5 cf. 18:18-22 & 34:10-12; and compare too paragraphs 143f above.

357. Sozomen, around 447 A.D.,¹⁴⁹ in his *Ecclesiastical History* condemns¹⁵⁰ "the error of Montanus." He condemns also all those Montanistic "heretics in...Phrygia and the neighbouring regions" who had "since the time of Montanus existed in great numbers -- and do so to the present day."

358. The A.D. 450 Syrian Theodoret of Cyrrhus insists that the tongues mentioned in First Corinthians 14:22 were not ecstatic, but clearly linguistic (*lingua*) -- yet also complains

that "every city lies open...to them that are sick with the unsoundness of...Montanus." ¹⁵¹ And Gennadius, around 480f A.D., ¹⁵² remarks that the maverick Macrobius the Presbyter (about 370 A.D.)...was...among the...Montanists at Rome. ¹⁵³

359. Indeed, even after the first proclamations of the Bishop of Rome as Pope (in A.D. 606 to 666) -- and as late as the 692 A.D. Council of Quinisext -- the "**Montanists who here are called Phrygians**" were and are "**heretics**." In fact, they were even to be regarded "as Gentiles" (alias unbelieving Heathen). ¹⁵⁴

360. Here then is a summary about ecstatic 'tongues-speaking' in or around the Christian Church during the first half-millennium of its existence. We give a summary of the testimony of the Apostles, of the Apostolic Fathers, of the Apologists, of the Anti-Gnostic Fathers, of the Alexandrian Fathers, of the Nicene Fathers, and of the Post-Nicene Fathers -- down till deep into the fifth century A.D.

361. They knew nothing of any 'ongoing miracles' in Post-Apostolic times. Yet the heretical Montanists (150 to 200 A.D.) claimed -- unverifiably! -- to be able to 'speak in other tongues' ecstatically, and also to be able to perform other 'prophetic' signs and 'wonders.'

362. Before then, the Lord Jesus Christ Himself condemned ecstatic utterances, and warned against 'false-wonderworkers' (Matthew 6:7f & 7:15-23 & 24:5,11,24f). So too did the Apostle Paul (First Corinthians 12:2f & 14:7-32 and Second Corinthians 11:3-13f). So too did the Apostle John (First John 4:1-6 and Revelation 13:13f & 16:14). Indeed, all of them seem to have predicted that 'true miracles' would cease at the end of the Apostolic Age (Mark 16:14-20 and First Corinthians 13:8f *cf.* Hebrews 1:1f & 2:3f and Rev. 22:18f).

363. Too, early in Post-Apostolic times, Hermas and Clement of Alexandria and Eusebius *etc.* all condemned ongoing ecstatic utterances as 'false-prophecy.' Indeed, up until at least Tertullian (220 A.D.), no extant writing of any Church Leader claims that any kind of genuine miracle had ever occurred since the days of the Apostles (which ended well before 98 A.D.).

364. Some of the Post-Apostolic Fathers did claim that miraculous gifts had been practised in earlier (New Testament) times. Yet, although some of those Post-Apostolic Fathers wrote to or from churches where the miraculous gifts had indeed been occurring during the Apostolic Age -- there is no mention at all of any continued existence or recurrence of these miraculous gifts in Post-Apostolic times.

365. Nothing is found on this in the letter of Clement of Rome to the church in Corinth(!) -- nor in the letter of Ignatius to the church at Ephesus. The Apostolic Fathers lived in cities, and wrote to cities in every significant area of the Roman Empire. If Biblical *glossalalia* and other true miracles had been widespread or even in existence in their times -- such would certainly have been alluded to in their Post-Apostolic writings. But that is not the case.

366. The Apostolic Fathers indeed wrote on every major Bible doctrine. Yet there is no mention of recurring 'tongues' or other ongoing miracles in any of their writings. They

constantly sought to show the superiority of Christianity to other systems of thought. Yet Biblical *glossalalia* and miracles are never cited as examples of this.

367. There is only one acceptable explanation for this deafening silence about miraculous ‘tongues-speaking’ and other true miracles even in the very earliest post-apostolic times. That one explanation -- is the cessation and subsequent non-existence of truly-miraculous ‘tongues-speaking’ and other true miracles, as from the end of the Apostolic Era (and indeed with the completion of Scripture as the one needed permanent means of revelation). See, for full details, the author’s Ph.D. dissertation *Miracles: What and When and Why?*¹⁵⁵

368. With the papalization of the Western Church from the seventh century onward, the ecclesiastical use of particularly the even-then-rather-arcane Latin tongue -- unknown to the bulk of the various peoples within the West’s so-called ‘Holy Roman Empire’ -- drove a wedge between the Bible and most Christians. This is a wedge which Romanism would perpetuate right down to the twentieth century, and which arcane Pentecostalism has perpetuated in its pseudo-glossalalic so-called ‘prophecies’ ever since.

369. Ultra-Montane and Extremist-Romanist blasphemies that the mediaeval Francis of Assisi performed greater miracles than even Jesus Christ -- should not even be dignified with comment. Frankly, such blasphemies only betray the obvious fact that those making them -- are not really Christ-ians -- at all.

370. Again, it is sometimes claimed that the A.D. 1048-1179 Hildegard -- the so-called ‘Sibyl of the Rhine’ -- herself spoke in tongues miraculously. This claim is made on the basis of her utterances in her very own *Lingua Ignota* or ‘Unknown Tongue.’ But M.D. Barry, in his own work *St. Hildegard*, describes her invented alphabet and ‘language’ as a mere diversion.

371. Similarly, the famous Jesuit Missionary Francis Xavier (1506-1552) is sometimes also said to have spoken in tongues miraculously. His Romanist biographer James Broderick, however, copiously disproves this false claim.¹⁵⁶

372. Significantly, Xavier’s Fellow-Jesuit Ignatius de Loyola confessed that he too had done no miracles. Indeed, no such claims are made in his first biography. Subsequent biographies, however, eliminated Loyola’s own admission -- and falsely alleged the contrary.

373. In 1517, the Lord sent the great Protestant Reformation to make His Word again accessible to His various peoples (*cf.* the original Greek at Revelation 5:9 & 7:9f & 21:3). Henceforth, that was to be accessed no longer with great difficulty -- in the then very largely unknown tongue of Latin. Henceforth, that could be accessed rather easily, and in their own native languages or mother-tongues.

374. Thus Rev. Dr. Martin Luther, the great Bible Translator and Protestant Reformer, emphasized not magic or miracles. He also preached to the masses in their own vernacular. Indeed, yet more importantly, he urged them all to read the Holy Bible for themselves.

375. Luther also refers to "the example of Ananias, in Acts, and of Peter who forthwith killed the liar [Ananias] with a word." Comments Luther: "I believe Peter did not do this of himself, but by revelation. For God wished to **establish** the primitive Church by means of miracles."¹⁵⁷

376. Indeed, in his *Preface to the Revelation of St. John*,¹⁵⁸ Luther comments at Revelation 8:7f: "The first bad angel, is Tatian.... The second is Marcion, with his **Cataphrygians**, Manichaeans, **Montanists**, *etc.*, who boast their spirits above all the Scriptures and move...between Heaven and Earth. So do, in our day, [the **Anabaptist**] Münzer and the fanatics....

377. "They devised the slogan: 'Spirit! Spirit! The Spirit must do it! The letter kills!'" -- exclaims Luther. "Thus Münzer [derisively] called us Wittenberg Theologians, 'men "learned" in the Scriptures' -- and [deludedly called] himself, 'the man taught by the Spirit'.... There you see how the devil had armed himself -- and built up his barricades!"¹⁵⁹

378. Luther regarded¹⁶⁰ Revelation 8:8 as a picture of those "who boast their spirits above all the Scripture and move -- like this 'burning mountain' -- between Heaven and Earth." Such, he insists, "in our day, do Münzer and the fanatics." Thus the average German Anabaptist also wished to have "nothing to do with baptism" (meaning infant baptism).

379. Even Harvard's pro-pentecostalist Professor Dr. G.H. Williams admits¹⁶¹ that among the Anabaptists in general "the imminent advent...was discussed and calculated with enthusiasm. Group confession led to disclosures that alarmed spouses.... Glossalalia broke out. There was...the extraordinary declaration of a deranged woman that she was predestined to give birth to the Antichrist."

380. In Switzerland, the Protestant Reformer Rev. Dr. Ulrich Zwingli condemned the Anabaptists' proto-pentecostalist revolutionary and epilepsy-like "**babbling under the claim of inspiration**."¹⁶² Indeed, he explains how "that anabaptistic pest crawls particularly into places where the pure doctrine of Christ begins to emerge.... From this...it can clearly be seen that it is sent by Satan -- in order to strangle healthy seed while the latter is germinating."¹⁶³

381. Similarly, the great Presbyterian Reformer Rev. Professor John Calvin testifies that "Eusebius...censures Montanus"; and that "**Montanus**, the Encratites and the like...were indeed long since condemned."¹⁶⁴ Calvin even asks "what **fury** drives them" -- namely "**the Pope**" and "Serycius" -- when they "subscribe openly to Montanus, the Encratites, and the Manichees?" For further exhaustive details of especially Calvin's denial of Post-Apostolic ongoing miracles, see the author's *Miracles: What and When and Why?*

382. In his *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, Calvin rejects¹⁶⁵ the allegations by Romanism that Biblical Protestants were "**Anabaptists**." For, as he next states, "the Anabaptists began to assail **us**" -- *viz.*, the Bible-believing Protestants! He repudiates¹⁶⁶ the Anabaptistic "**madness**" of these "giddy men...who, while they make a great display of the superiority of the Spirit..., deride the simplicity of those [such as the Protestants] who only delight in what they [the Anabaptists] call 'the dead and deadly letter.'"

383. Indeed, adds Calvin,¹⁶⁷ "some **Anabaptists** in the present age **mistake** some **indescribable** sort of **frenzied excess** -- for the **regeneration** of the Spirit.... It would be incredible that the human mind could proceed to **such insanity**....

384. "Yet, this philosophy is popular with those who...**have thrown off common sense**.... **What kind of 'spirit' do they belch forth?**

385. "We [Protestant Christians] acknowledge...one Spirit.... That Spirit is...the Author of love, chastity, **sobriety**, modesty, peace, moderation and truth. He is **not a spirit of giddiness**, rushing rashly and precipitately, **without...wisdom and understanding**....

386. "But why dwell longer in refuting that **brutish frenzy** [of the Anabaptists]? To Christians, **the Spirit of the Lord is not a turbulent phantom** which they themselves have produced by **dreaming**.... But they [viz. true Protestant Christians] religiously seek the knowledge of Him -- from **Scripture!**"

387. Explains Calvin:¹⁶⁸ "In our day have arisen certain **frantic** men, such as Servetus and others who by new devices have thrown everything into **confusion**.... Servetus, not the least among the **Anabaptists**," also wrongly assumes that "infants...are unable to believe [and to be baptized]..."

388. "But what I have said again and again, I now repeat.... From non-age...God takes His own methods of regenerating."

389. Calvin, then, reprehends the quasi-pentecostalism of the libertine Anabaptists. Declares that great Reformer: "The **Anabaptists** cannot make their cause appear good, except by **muddling** everything.... Their entire teaching is a **confused mess**.... They often use forms of **speech** that are **absurd** and **outlandish**."¹⁶⁹

390. Now at least one such libertine Anabaptist group, the Quintinists, seem to have been proto-pentecostalistic! For, explained Calvin, like "'Wandering Beggars' -- as they are called -- they possess a **unique jargon** which is understood only by their brotherhood....

391. "The Quintinists **possess an unbelievable tongue in which they banter**, to the extent that one understands it about as little as **a bird's song**." Bird-like 'songs of praise' -- like the warblings of birdsongs by Tennessee hillbilly 'Holy Rollers' and other Pentecostalists elsewhere hollering and whooping and birdsinging on their hill!

392. Calvin calls these followers of the libertine Anabaptist Quintin, "**loud-mouthed boasters**" -- like the "**scum and froth**" mentioned in Second Peter 2:18 and Jude 16. "**They babble**," the Reformer observes of these Quintinists.

393. The genius of Geneva continues: "I remember once, in a large group, how Quintin...told me that I found his ideas unacceptable -- owing to a lack of understanding. To which I replied that I understood better than he -- since **he knew nothing of what he was saying**, and I at least recognized that he wanted to seduce the world by means of absurd and dangerous follies....

394. "God created the tongue for the purpose of expressing **thought**, in order that we might be able to **communicate with each other**. Consequently, it is a perversion of God's order to **pommel the air** with a **confused sound** that **cannot be understood**....

395. "**The Scriptures** ought to be our guide with respect to how God's mysteries are handled. Therefore **let us adopt the language that it uses**, without being **lightheaded**.... He [the Lord] uses toward us a...way of speaking in order to be **understood**. Whosoever therefore reverses this order -- only succeeds in burying God's truth....

396. "We must labour to unravel their [Quintinistic] **obscurities**, in order to drag them, if necessary by force, into the light -- so that their **abominations**, which they make a point of hiding, might be known to all the World. Similarly, every Christian must be warned that when he hears them **garbling** as they do -- he must cut them off immediately at the spigot, and say to them: 'Either speak the language that the Lord has taught us and which He uses in His **Scriptures** -- or go "speak" [sic] to the **rocks and trees!**'"

397. Yet, adds Calvin, it is before men that Quintinists still "**speak with a doubtful tongue** -- a practice that even Pagans condemned." Indeed, "**Jesus Christ...did not babble unintelligently**...after the example of **their predecessors** the **Priscillianists**" alias the proto-anabaptistic and proto-pentecostalistic **Montanists!**

398. As to the Anabaptist Quintinists, continues Calvin, "they pursue a double purpose" (*sic*). They say "one should not be content with what is written or acquiesce in it at all -- but one should speculate higher, and **look for new revelations**.... This sect is certainly different from the Papists -- inasmuch as it is a hundred times worse and more pernicious." **Anabaptistic pseudo-glossalists, said Calvin, are a hundred times worse than Papists!**

399. Calvin elucidates: "We must note to what end our Lord has promised us His Spirit. Now He did not promise the Spirit for the purpose of forsaking Scripture, so that we might be led by Him and stroll amid the clouds [away from Scripture] -- but in order to **gain its true meaning** and thus be satisfied.... After His resurrection, when He opened the understanding of His two disciples (Luke 24:27-32), it was not in order to inspire them with strange subjects not found in Scripture -- but **in order to help them understand Scripture**."

400. Yes, not to ecstasize -- but to understand! And to understand Scripture -- not the wafflings of enthusiastic evanjellyfish!

401. Continues John Calvin: "Spirit and Scripture are one and the same.... We choke out the light of God's Spirit -- if we cut ourselves off from His Word....

402. "Preaching and Scripture are the true instruments of God's Spirit. Therefore, let us consider anyone a devil who wants to lead us astray from it, whether directly or indirectly -- and let us flee from them as we would a poison!"¹⁷⁰

403. Apart from the above-mentioned Quintin, yet another such weird Anabaptist and prototype of Pentecostalism was Belot. He was one whom Calvin describes as: "giving

himself, with raised head and rolling eyes, the majestic aspect of a 'Prophet.'" Belot had invaded Geneva -- precisely in order to distribute Anabaptist tracts advocating their perfectionism -- and falsely accusing the humble Calvin.¹⁷¹

404. The genius of Geneva, however, did take one last swing¹⁷² -- this time at the proto-pentecostalist Anabaptist Pocquet. Writes Calvin: "I have decided to inform the reader more amply, by inserting here the ramblings of Monsieur Anthony Pocquet....

405. "He begins to 'froth at the mouth' -- as Saint Jude says (verse 16)... On the surface, Monsieur Anthony Pocquet has become a demi-angel -- hearing him speak in such a lofty manner, as if he no longer had sensations of anything except heavenly matters....

406. "He pretends to save the world from the simple and pure teaching of the Scripture. As if it were the wisdom of Christians to search after new revelations! And he now calls it 'a double [portion of] spirit' -- to pass beyond the contents of Scripture.

407. "Still, whenever it suits them, they interpret Scripture in a totally different sense.... These serpents twist the terms.... 'Spirit' to them is not derived from the grace of regeneration.

408. "Rather is it [to the ecstatic Quintinists] the fantasy that God is in us and we must permit Him to do whatever 'He' wants. We also see what they mean by 'the life which we have in Jesus Christ.' *I.e.*, that everything is lawful [antinomianly] -- and there is no evil, provided we are not conscious of it....

409. "Monsieur Anthony Pocquet...is a wolf in sheepskin.... We should not allow this wicked man to bring such shame on a Christian people....

410. "He says...we are under the law of 'love'.... I ask him, whether Moses and the judges did not hear the people's disputes and decide them? What sort of a scatterbrained man is it who plunges across [the] country on the basis of badly-founded speculations?... His daydreams are so silly and absurd, that among sane intelligent people it is enough to have pointed them out -- so that one can be on guard....

411. "He says that medicine came into the World through the suggestion of the evil spirit. [But] I say...that it came from God, inasmuch as it is a knowledge of carefully using the gifts of creation which He gives us.... He [Pocquet] says we are not obligated to do the Commandments of God.... This loathsome teaching...is not only repugnant to God, but so full of detestable errors as to make one's hair stand on end!"

412. The various Calvinistic symbols quickly followed suit. Thus the *Westminster Confession* (I:8 & XX:3) would soon declare: "The people of God...have right unto and interest in the Scriptures and are commanded in the fear of God to read and search them (John 5:39). Therefore they are to be translated into the vulgar tongue of every nation unto which they come (First Corinthians 14:6-28), that they may worship...in an acceptable manner (Colossians 3:16)... Prayer...is by God required of all men...with understanding...and, if vocal, in a known tongue (First Corinthians 14:14)."

413. Also the *Westminster Directory for the Public Worship of God* requires the **public reading** of the Bible to be "in the vulgar tongue, out of the best allowed translation -- distinctly, that all may hear and understand." It also adds that the **public preaching** thereof is to be done "plainly, that the meanest may understand." This means "in demonstration of the Spirit and of power" -- but too "abstaining also from an unprofitable use of unknown tongues, strange phrases, and cadences of sounds." Pentecostals, note well!

414. This in itself banishes the use, during public worship, of unknown tongues such as Latin. As the *Confession of Faith of the Kirk of Scotland or the National Covenant* clearly states: "In special, we detest and refuse the usurped authority of that Roman Anichrist" with "his erroneous doctrine against the sufficiency of the Written Word" and more especially his "**praying or speaking in a strange language.**" Instead, we are to beseech "the Lord to strengthen us by His Holy Spirit...and to bless our desires and proceedings with a happy success -- that religion and righteousness may flourish in the land."

415. Writes H.J. Lawlor on 'Montanism*' in the 1910 edition of the *Hastings' Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics*: "About A.D. 156, **Montanus**, a recent convert, who had been a **pagan priest**, began to 'prophesy.' His 'prophesyings' were accompanied by strange *phenomena* resembling those associated with **demoniacal possession**....

416. "He spoke while he was actually in a state of **ecstasy**. The 'ecstasy' of Montanus was a kind of **madness**, deliberately induced.... The so-called 'ecstasy' of Montanus was in fact... *par-ek-stasis* (thus Eusebius, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, V:16:7,14)... Montanus declares that...the phrases which fell from his lips were actually the *ipsissima verba* of the Deity....

417. "Montanus was joined by two women, Maximilla and Priscilla or Prisca who -- with his sanction -- deserted their husbands, and who also claimed to possess the prophetic *charisma*. Their utterances were similar in matter and in manner to those of their leader.

418. "They arrogated to themselves the title *pneumatikon* -- as distinguishing them[selves] from other Christians (*psuchikoi*).... The 'charisma' was not regarded as confined to Montanus and 'the women.' Theodotus, *e.g.*, was an 'ecstatic' -- and was reported to have died while in an 'ecstasy.'

419. "Many of those who heard Montanus and his companions, would have silenced them.... Many synods met in Asia [Minor], and excommunicated its [Montanism's] adherents....

420. "The Montanists used scathing words about the ecclesiastical rulers, and stigmatized them as 'slayers of the prophets'.... Of the peculiarities of Montanism...some were...in harmony with what is known of the Oriental religious temperament, especially that of the Phrygians, and may be accounted for by the influence of environment" -- namely of the pagan religion of Cybele which then prevailed among them in that Phoenician colony.

421. The 1974 *Encyclopaedia Britannica* presents quite a good few important statements¹⁷³ on 'Montanus' and 'Montanism.' "Montanus," it states, was the "founder of Montanism, a **pentecostal** outgrowth of Christianity in Asia Minor.... Before his conversion

to Christianity, he apparently was a priest of the Oriental ecstatic cult of Cybele the 'Mother Goddess' of fertility....

422. "Montanus, [after his baptism] *circa* 172-173 [A.D.], entered into an ecstatic state and began 'prophesying' in the region of Phrygia.... Claiming to be the voice of the Holy Spirit, he announced the fulfilment of the New Testament promise of Pentecost....

423. "Montanus became the leader of a group of *Illuminati* ['The Enlightened Ones'].... The members exhibited the frenzied nature of their religious experience -- by enraptured seizures and utterances of strange 'languages' that the[ir] disciples regarded as oracles of the Holy Spirit.

424. "Phrygia traditionally had been a centre [*sic!*] of religious mystery-rites of Cybele and her consort Attis, whose devotees engaged in frenetic dancing. Hence Montanus and his followers began to be called Phrygians or Cataphrygians....

425. "The movement spread throughout Asia Minor. Inscriptions have shown that many towns were almost completely converted to Montanism....

426. "It soon became evident, however, that the Montanist 'prophecy' was new. True Prophets did not, as Montanists did, deliberately induce a kind of ecstatic intensity and a state of passivity and then maintain that the words they spoke were the voice of the Spirit.... The freedom of doctrinal innovation that Montanus advocated, could well have led to doctrinal anarchy.... The result of the struggle against this heresy, was the suppression of...ecstatic 'inspiration'...viewed by the Church as **demonic**."

427. First John 2:20-27 says, *inter alia*: "You [plural] have an unction from the Holy One, and you know all things. I have not written to you because you do not know the truth.... [The pseudo-anointed] antichrist [*cf.* the Trinity-denying Unitarian Pentecostalists] keeps on denying the Father.... These things I have written to you, concerning them that seduce you. But the anointing, which you have received, keeps on abiding in you."

428. As Rev. Professor Dr. Abraham Kuyper Sr. observes, this passage was not spoken to antichristed ecstatic individuals. Instead, it was spoken to the Spirit-anointed and cognizant Church as a whole.

429. For, explains Kuyper, it "is **not** saying: 'I am actually stupid to speak to you -- because you already know everything!' Instead, **John is warning against** the heresy of the Gnostics and the **Montanists** -- who wanted to introduce something new into the Church, as if she had not possessed all she needed!"¹⁷⁴

430. Indeed, Presbyterian Professor of Theology Dr. Frederick Dale Bruner adds something very significant in his own definitive book *A Theology of the Holy Spirit: The Pentecostal Experience and the New Testament Witness*. There is, says Professor Bruner, "**striking similarity** at almost **every point** -- between the **doctrinal and experiential emphases of Montanism**, and those of **modern Pentecostalism**."¹⁷⁵

431. Naturally, we would never suggest that the [often sincere] Pentecostals of today are even vaguely aware that Montanism roots in the pagan worship of Baal and Astarte. See paragraphs 53f above. But some modern Pentecostals and Pentecostalizers are fully aware of their own Montanistic spiritual ancestry, passing back through the admittedly-dynamic Montanism to what Pentecostals regard as their New Testament roots.

432. For example, John Thomas Nichol's book *Pentecostalism* is dedicated to his parents and his parents-in-law as **great "Pentecostal Pioneers."**¹⁷⁶ There, Nichol declares:¹⁷⁷

433. "The **charismatic gifts** did not disappear entirely; they were **incompatible** with the **regular order** of liturgical service. It was against this tendency to organize; to supersede the Prophets by the Episcopate; to minimize the supernatural work and direction of the Holy Spirit -- that **Montanus** (A.D. 156) undoubtedly fought. He called upon his followers to live in a state of **frequent ecstasy** and **vision[s]**.

434. "That **he set a good example**, is evident.... Glossalalia later reappeared infrequently, among the **Radical Anabaptists** in sixteenth-century Germany.... In mid-eighteenth century America, the gift of tongues was most prolific among the [**commune-istic**] **Shakers**....

435. "During the early decades of the nineteenth century..., [the '**New Apostolic**'] **Irving's** immense prestige gave recognition to the 'tongues' and 'prophesyings' -- and made both of them respectable.... Disregarding the persistent advice of his trustees, the Church Session and the Presbytery of London, Irving would not...forbid tongues-speaking in his church....

436. "There are...**striking similarities** between the **Irvingites** and the **Pentecostals** who flourished seventy years later.... Irving and his charismatic followers were **expelled from the Presbyterian Church.**" Ah yes, indeed!

437. As unadulterated Presbyterians, we ourselves strongly believe in the full ministry of God the Holy Spirit as the Final Person of the Divine Trinity and as the Great Lifegiver to the Christian Church (Matthew 28:19 cf. First Corinthians 2:4-16). We praise God for the Spirit's once-and-for-all descent into His Church on the Pentecost Sunday of Acts two, and for His indwelling power ever since (John 14:12-26 cf. 16:13-15).

438. Hence we would always heed the apostolic injunction to keep on being filled with the Spirit, by keeping on subjecting ourselves under God to one another -- in the Church, in marriage, in the family, in business, and in the whole of our lives (Ephesians 5:18 to 6:18f). Indeed, we would constantly keep on pleading to God -- asking Him to keep on giving us ever more of the fruit of the Spirit in all that we do: more love, joy, peace, patience, gentleness, goodness, faithfulness, lawabidingness, and ever more self-control (Galatians 5:22f).

439. However. While certainly accepting that some Pentecostals are indeed true and sometimes even dedicated Christians, we must also insist that they are misguided (at least as far as their Pentecostalism is concerned). For we fully agree with the Pentecostalist John Thomas Nichol (see our paragraphs 432-36 above) that 'Pentecostalism' is epitomized by

‘Montanus’ and that it is also quite irreconcilable with ‘the Presbyterian Church.’ Cf. the *Westminster Confession of Faith* 1:1f and 1:6m and 1:8u and 21:1b and 21:3m).

440. For, as regards His revelation -- God decided to "commit the same wholly unto writing, which maketh the Holy Scripture to be most necessary." Consequently, all "former ways of God's revealing His will" -- such as through miraculous tongues-speakings (*etc.*) -- have "now ceased (Hebrews 1:1-2)."

441. To this Holy Scripture, "nothing at any time is to be added -- whether by new revelations of the Spirit, or traditions of men (Second Timothy 3:15-17; Galatians 1:8-9; Second Thessalonians 2:2)." This means that "the true God...may not be worshipped according to the imagination and devices of men or the suggestion of Satan or any other way not prescribed in the Holy Scripture (Deuteronomy 12:32 and Matthew 15:9 and Colossians 2:23)."

442. Accordingly, in the wise words of the *Westminster Confession of Faith* 21:3m, understandable "prayer...is...required.... If vocal, in a known tongue (First Corinthians 14:14)" -- and not in heretical or neo-pagan Pentecostalistic gobble-de-gook!

443. For Pentecostalism is essentially antinomian. It is ebullient, ecstatic, effervescent, and ephemeral entertainment. But True Christianity is decidedly decalogical. It therefore requires regulated, reinforced, reinvigorated and reverent worship.

444. In the long term and the final haul, the future belongs not to Anti-Mosaic Pentecostalism but only to Whole-Bible True Christianity. For, in the inspired words of Revelation 15:3f, even in glory the elect "sing the song of Moses the servant of God and the song of the Lamb, saying: ‘Great and marvellous are Your works, Lord God Almighty! Just and true are Your ways, You King of saints! Who shall not fear You, O Lord, and glorify Your Name? For You only art holy! For all nations shall come and worship before You!"

ENDNOTES

- 1) *Bile'aam* means ‘wasting of the people’ (thus Davidson’s *Analytical Concordance*) or ‘lord of the people’ or *ba'al-aam* (thus Young’s *Concordance*). This should also be compared with *Ba'al* (or Lord), and with *Ba'al-aam* (or ‘Lord of the people’).
- 2) 1974 *Micropaedia*, I pp. 703 & 577 and III:560f *Macropaedia* VIII:948 and *Micropaedia* VI:957f. See too *New Illustrated Columbia Encyclopedia*, Columbia University Press, New York, 1978, 17:5291f & 17:5286.
- 3) 1979:III, pp. 2-3; & II, p. 546.
- 4) *Biblical Commentary on the Old Testament: Pentateuch*, Edinburgh: Clark, II, p. 222.
- 5) Keil & Delitzsch’s *Commentary on First Kings*, 16: 29-34.
- 6) *Ibid.*, on I Kgs. 14:21,31.

- 7) *Ib.*, on I Kgs. 18:26-29.
- 8) *Cambridge Bible for Schools and Colleges*, at I Kgs. 18:19,26-29.
- 9) At I Kgs. 14:23; 15:13; 18:4,18,19,22,27,29.
- 10) *Commentary on Matthew* (6:7), Cape Town, South African Bible Association, n.d., p. 37.
- 11) *Ib.*, *in loco*, on Rev. 2:18-21.
- 12) 1975 *Macropaedia*, III, p. 172.
- 13) 1948 ed., art. 'Astarte.'
- 14) 1929 ed.
- 15) 1979 ed., VIII, p. 363
- 16) New York: Macmillan, 1983 rep., pp. 76, 378f, 381, 390.
- 17) *Ib.*, pp. 403-405.
- 18) *Ib.*, pp. 407-14 & 117.
- 19) Zürich: Zwingli Pubs., 1962, pp. 62 & 90.
- 20) *Commentary on First Corinthians* (Theme), Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1960 rep., p. 8.
- 21) Barnes's 'Introduction' to his *Commentary on First Corinthians*, Baker, 1972, p. iv.
- 22) *Did.* I:5; II:3-8; V:1; ch. VI; XI:4-12 (*cf.* I:1 to II:7 & V:1-8); and 16:3-4.
- 23) *Ad Cor.* 1:2; 1:1; chs. 11 to 14.
- 24) *Barn.* chs. 5,6,13,1,19,4,20.
- 25) *Ad Eph.* chs. 9,16,19; *ad Philad.* 5 (longer); *ad Polyc.* 1 & 2; *ad Ant.* 11 (Syriac); and *ad Philipp.* superscript & 2 (Syriac).
- 26) *Ist Ap.* ch. 27.
- 27) II:73; V:5-9; VII:49.
- 28) *Aen.* 11:728-34; IV:54-60f; IV:294-304; XI:768-69.
- 29) Kurtz's *Church History*, London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1884, I, p. 226; Schaff: *Church History*, Grand Rapids, Eerdmans, 1971, II, pp. 417-21.
- 30) Schaff: *op. cit.*, p. 417.
- 31) Tert., *de jejun.* 11.
- 32) *Hist. Eccl.*, V:16.
- 33) *Shepherd of Hermas* II:11.

- 34) *Ist Ap.*, 14; *Ib.*, ch. 30; *Dial.* 39 & 82; *Hort. Add. to Greeks*, 16 & 17; *Frag.* XIX from *Apol.* V. J.-P. Migne *Patrologia Graeca*, 1867, Paris, 6:683-86, on Justin's *Dial.* 87-88, has: (87) "Anepausato oun, tot' estin epausato, elthontos ekeinou meth' hon tees oikonomias tautes tois en anthroopois auto genomenous (46) chronois pausasthai edei auta aph' humoon, kai en toutooi anapausin labonta, palin, hoos epepropheteuto, geneesesthai domata, ha apo tees charitos tees dunameoos tou Pneumatos ekeinou tois ep' auton pisteuousi didoosin hoos axion hekaston epistatai. Hoti epepropheteuto (47) touto mellein ginesthai hup' autou meta teen eis ouranon aneleusin autou, 'eipon men eedee, kai palin legoo. 'Eipen oun 'Anebee eis hupsos, ee chmaloteusen aichmalootesian: edooke domata tous huiois toon anthroopoon.' Kai palin en hetera propheeteia, heireetai: 'Kai estai meta tauta, ekcheoo to Pneuma Mou epi pasan sarka, kai epi tous doulous Mou, kai epi tas doulas Mou, kai propheeteousi'.... (88) Quare non quod virtutes esset indignus praedictum est venturus in eum...sed quod ultra futura non essent. Atque illud etiam vobis testimonio sit Hooste ou dia to einai Auton endeee dunameoos epeprotheteuto exeusestai ep' Auton tas dunameis tas kateerithmeenenas hupo Heesaïou, alla...dia to epekeina mee mellein esesthai." In his Latin translation of Justin's Greek, Migne has for our English: "these gifts should cease among you [Judaists]" -- *et in eo requiescentia effundi dona illa*. For "having come to an end in Him, should again be given...to all His believers." Migne has: *His qui in Ipsum creduit*. For: "It had been predicted that He would do this after His ascension into Heaven." Migne has *postquam in Coelum ascendisset ita facturum*. For: "It is said therefore: 'He ascended on high; He led captivity captive; He gave gifts to the sons of men.'" Migne has *Dedit dona filiis hominum*. Further: "Now (Atque) if you look around you can see (*apud nos videre est*) among us Christians [*par' heemin* (48) *est in idein*] both men and women, endowed with gifts from the Spirit of God (*qui dona a Spiritu Dei habent*) [*charismata apo tou Pneumatos tou Theou echontas*]. Thus, it was not because Christ needed the powers enumerated by Isaiah that it was foretold that they would come upon Him, but only because they would not exist any more afterwards. *Quare non quod virtutes esset indignus praedictum est venturus in Eum...sed quod ultra futura non essent*.
- 35) *Add. to the Greeks*, I, ch. 12.
- 36) Euseb.: *Hist. Eccl.* IV:26:1 & n.1 (1971, Eerdmans's *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 2nd Series, I, p. 203 n; *cf. ib.* III, p. 369 (Jerome's *Vir. Illust.* 24).
- 37) *Ad Autol.* II:8
- 38) *Plea for the Christians*, chs. 26 & 27.
- 39) *Ante-Nic. Fathers*, Eerdmans ed., I:309.
- 40) *Adv. Haer.* I:13:1-7; I:14:7-8; I:15:4; I:16:4; II:32:4; III:11:9; V:6:1. See too in Eusebius's *op. cit.* V:20:1.
- 41) *Ib.*, V, pp. 599-601.
- 42) Tertullian: *Against All Heresies* ch. 7.
- 43) Augustine's *On Heresy* and P. Schaff's *History of the Christian Church*, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, 1976, II:421 & n. 1.
- 44) *Strom.* I:16f and VIII:18 (last para.).
- 45) Origen: *Ag. Cels.*, Preface:2 & I:2 & VII:8 & VIII:45-47.
- 46) *Ib.* VII:8 & VII:11.
- 47) *Ib.* VII:3f & VII:8 *cf.* art. 'Celsus' in *New International Dictionary of the Christian Church*, Zondervan, 1974.

- 48) *Adv. Cels.* III:24 & VII:3-4 & VIII:48.
- 49) *Ante-Nic. Fath.* V, p. 6.
- 50) Hippolytus: *Refutation of All Heresies* V:3.
- 51) *Ib.* V:4.
- 52) *Ib.*, V:3.
- 53) *Ib.*, VIII:12.
- 54) *Ib.*, X:22f.
- 55) *Ante-Nic. Fath.* VII, pp. 333 & 335 n. 1.
- 56) *Ib.* VII:335 n. 3 (I *Exordium*).
- 57) *Ib.*, p. 370 (from Book I).
- 58) *Ib.*, pp. 366-67 (from Bks. II & VII-IX).
- 59) *Ante-Nic. Fath.* V, p. 264.
- 60) *Ep.* 74:7,10.
- 61) *Ante-Nic. Fath.* VI, p. 305.
- 62) Cf. our paragraphs 119f.
- 63) *Adv. Gen.*, V:5 & in *Ante-Nic. Fath.*, Eerdmans 1971, VI, p.491 & n.
- 64) Cf. our paragraphs 119f.
- 65) *Adv. Gen.*, 11:73 & V:7.
- 66) *Ib.*, V:19.
- 67) *Ib.*, V:20.
- 68) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.* 2nd Ser. I:45.
- 69) *Ib.*, V:4:lf.
- 70) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, I, pp. 219f.
- 71) Eusebius: *op. cit.* V:17:1-5 cf. V:16:3.
- 72) *Op. cit.*, p. 206.
- 73) *Id.*, and *Hist. Eccl.* IV:27:1 & V:16:1.
- 74) *Ib.*, V:16:3-5.
- 75) *Ib.* V:3:4.
- 76) *Hist. Eccl.* V:14:1.

- 77) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 2nd Ser. I:233f n. 1.
- 78) *Hist. Eccl.* V:20:1 and *Ante-Nic. Fath.* I p. 309. compare *Adv. Haer.* 1:13:1-7; 14:7-8; 15:4; 16:3.
- 79) *Hist. Eccl.* V:20:1 & n.
- 80) *Ib.*, V:14:1 to 15:1 & n.
- 81) *Ib.*, V:16:13.
- 82) *Ib.* V:16:14f.
- 83) *Ib.*, V:13:1.
- 84) Tatian: *Address to the Greeks* (ch. 12).
- 85) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, I, p. 227, n. 1; compare *Hist. Eccl.* V:18:1-5 & 12.
- 86) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, I, p. 237, n. 1.
- 87) *Cf.* our paragraphs 233f *supra*.
- 88) *Hist. Eccl.* V:19:1-3.
- 89) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, I, p. 130, n. 12.
- 90) *Hist. Eccl.* VI:20:3.
- 91) See *ib.*, III:25:7.
- 92) *Ib.* III:31:4f.
- 93) *Ib.* III:25:7.
- 94) *Ante-Nic. Fath.* V:601-4.
- 95) Eusebius: *op. cit.* II:15:6.
- 96) *Ib.*, V:16:1-7 *cf.* our paragraphs 233f *supra*.
- 97) *Hist. Eccl.* V:16:2-17f *cf.* our paragraphs 143f *supra*.
- 98) Paragraphs 203f *supra*, compare *Ante-Nic. Fath.*, VII, p. 336.
- 99) *Hist. Eccl.* V:16:18-19 & its n. 27.
- 100) Athanasius: *Discourses* I:3 & II:43 and *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 2nd Ser. IV:419 n. 3, *cf.* p. 451.
- 101) *De Syn.* 4; *cf.* Dr. H. Wise, in *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 2nd Series, p. 419 n. 3, *cf.* p. 451.
- 102) Athanasius: *On the Councils of Arimium and Seleucia* 4.
- 103) *De Syn.* 1:4.
- 104) *Cat. Lects.*, 16:8.

- 105) *Ib.*, 15:13-17.
- 106) Gregory of Nazianzen: *Fourth Theological Oration* ch. 20.
- 107) Gregory of Nazianzen: *Introduction to Oration Sixteen* (12).
- 108) *Orat.* 39:(4-5).
- 109) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.* 2nd Ser. VII:353 n. *gamma*.
- 110) *Orat.* 33:(16).
- 111) *Ep.* 188:1.
- 112) *Preface to Nahum*.
- 113) *De Vir. Illus.* 26.
- 114) *Ib.*, ch. 35.
- 115) *Ib.*, ch. 37.
- 116) *Ib.*, ch. 38.
- 117) *Ib.*, chs. 39-40.
- 118) *Ib.*, 38-40.
- 119) *Ib.*, 41.
- 120) *Ib.*, 59.
- 121) Jerome: *Epistle 41* (1-4).
- 122) *Ep.* 41:1-2f.
- 123) *Ep.* 41:3-4.
- 124) *Ep.* 133:4; & compare *Adv. Vigil., Int.* 8; and also *Ad Pammach. ad Joh. Jerus., Int.* 2.
- 125) Augustine: *On the Heresies* chs. 26 & 28. See too his *De Bono Viduitatis* (alias *Concerning the Virtue of Widowhood*) 6 -- and *Nic. & Post-Nic.Fath.*, 1st Series I:15 & I:18 and 2nd Ser. VIII:25 & n.
- 126) F.N. Lee: *Miracles -- What? When? Why?*, unpub., rev. ed., 1997, *in loc.*
- 127) Augustine: *Commentary on First John* (Homily VI:10).
- 128) Augustine: *On Baptism against the Donatists* III:16-21.
- 129) Augustine: *On the True Religion* XXV:47.
- 130) Augustine: *City of God* (XXI:7f & XXII:8) and his *Tracts on the Gospel of John* (3:22-29 & 14:10-14), *Tracts* 13:17 & 71-72.
- 131) Augustine: *Retractions* I:14:5 & I:13:7.

- 132) *Cf.* n. 130 *supra*.
- 133) *De Trin.* IV:11:14.
- 134) Chrysostom: *29th Hom. on 1st Cor.* (12:1-2). See too his *Exposition of the 44th Psalm*, 44:(45):1. *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 1st Series, XI:143 n.1.
- 135) Plato: *Apology for Socrates* ch. 7.
- 136) Epiphanius: *Against the Montanistic Heresy*. The original Greek here reads: "*Hosa gar hoi Propheetai eireekasi meta suneseos parakolouthentes ephthengonto.*" See *Nicene & Post-Nicene Fathers*, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, 1964, 2nd Series XI:143 n.1.
- 137) Epiphanius: *Heresies* chs. 38-39, compare *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, 2nd Series, I, pp. 230 n. 2 & 231 n. 12 & IV, p. 419 n. 3.
- 138) *Haer.* 28:1f or 48:1f.
- 139) *Ib.*, 28:3 or 48:3.
- 140) *Ib.*, 28:4-5 or 48:4-5.
- 141) *Ib.*, 28:7-8 or 48:7-8.
- 142) *Ib.*, 29:1-3 or 49:1-3.
- 143) *Can.* 7.
- 144) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, (2nd), II, pp. iii & lx.
- 145) *Eccl. Hist.* 11:37.
- 146) 1:23.
- 147) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, (2nd), XI, p. 127.
- 148) *Commonit.*, ch. 18.
- 149) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, (2nd), II, pp. 200f.
- 150) II:18 & 32.
- 151) Theodoret's *Ep.* 81. See too his *Interpretation of First Epistle to Corinthians* (14:22): "*Annon omnes sunt Galilaie qui loquantur, et quomodo audimus eos uniusquisque propria lingua in qua nati sumus, Parthi et medi, et quae sequuntur.*" As cited in Migne's *Pat. Graec.* 82 (Paris, 1859, Theod. 3).
- 152) *Nic. & Post-Nic. Fath.*, (2nd), III, p. 353.
- 153) Jerome/Gennadius: *Vit. Vir. Illus.*, III ch. 5.
- 154) *Can.* 95.
- 155) *Cf.* Gromacki's *The Modern Tongues Movement*, (Philadelphia: Presb. & Ref.), 1967, pp. 17f.
- 156) London: Burnes & Oates, 1952, pp. 457,15,85 *cf.* 77 & 64 & 131-38 & 142f & 267 & 284f & 396f & 491.

- 157) *Table Talks*, in Luther's *Letters of Spiritual Counsel*, in *The Library of Christian Classics*, London, SCM, 1955, XIII:308.
- 158) *Works of Martin Luther*, Philadelphia, Muhlenberg, 1932, VI, p. 482.
- 159) *The Councils and the Church* (1539), in Luther's *Works*, Muhlenberg ed., Philadelphia, 1931, V, pp. 131 & 292.
- 160) 1545 *Preface to the Revelation of St. John*, in Luther's *Works* (Muhlenberg ed.), VI p. 482.
- 161) See especially Williams's book *The Radical Reformation*, Westminster Press, Philadelphia, 1975, pp. XX,268-73,311-17,322f,335f,605f,621f,858f. Williams is the foremost authority sympathetic to Anabaptism. Earlier, with A.M. Mergal, he had co-authored also *Spiritual and Anabaptist Writers*, Westminster Press, Philadelphia, 1957.
- 162) See the citations in G.H. Williams's *Radical Reformation*, 1975, pp. 194f.
- 163) U. Zwingli: *Declaration of Christian Faith*, 1531, arts. 15,19,73-82,87-91 & 121-24.
- 164) *The True Method of Giving Peace & Reforming the Church*, in *Tracts & Treatises*, Grand Rapids, Eerdmans, 1958 rep., III, pp. 339, 331, 337.
- 165) *Inst.* IV:17:13-15.
- 166) *Ib.* I:9:1.
- 167) *Ib.* III:3:14.
- 168) J. Calvin: *Concerning Scandals* (1550), Eerdmans, Grand Rapids, 1978, pp. vii & 66f and *Inst.* IV:16:31-32.
- 169) J. Calvin: *Brief Instruction for Arming All the Good Faithful Against the Errors of the Common Sect of the Anabaptists*, in his *Treatises Against the Anabaptists and Against the Libertines*, Baker, Grand Rapids, ed. 1982, p. 156.
- 170) Calvin's *Against the Libertines* (in his *Treatises Against the Anabaptists and the Libertines*), pp. 213-25.
- 171) Williams: *op. cit.*, p. 597.
- 172) Calvin's *Against the Libertines* (in his *Treatises Against the Anabaptists and the Libertines*), pp. 299-336.
- 173) *Macropaedia* 15:66 and *Micropaedia* VI:1012-13.
- 174) *Dogmatic Dictations, Locus de Sac. Script.*, II, p. 112, 2nd ed., Kampen, Kok, n.d.
- 175) London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1971, p. 36.
- 176) New York: Harper & Row, 1966, frontispiece.
- 177) *Ib.*, pp. 20-24.



ABOUT THE AUTHOR - - ->

Dr. Francis Nigel Lee was born in 1934 in the Westmorland County of Cumbria (in Great Britain). He is the great-grandson of a fiery Preacher whose family disintegrated when he backslid. Dr. Lee's father was an Atheist, yet he married a Roman Catholic who raised her son Nigel in that faith. Yet, when Nigel was seven, his father led him into Atheism.

During World War II, the Royal Navy appointed Nigel's father Chief Radar Officer (South Atlantic). So the family then moved to South Africa. There, Nigel became a Calvinist; had the great privilege of leading both of his parents to Christ; and then became a Minister of God's Word and Sacraments in the Dutch Reformed Church of Natal, External Examiner in Ethics for the Stellenbosch Theological Seminary, and an Advocate (or Trial Lawyer) of the Supreme Court of South Africa.

Emigrating to the U.S.A., Dr. Lee attended the very first General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in America; transferred his ministerial credentials to that denomination; and pastored Congregations in Mississippi and Florida. He was also: Professor of Philosophy at Shelton College in N.J.; Visiting Lecturer in Apologetics at Reformed Theological Seminary in Jackson Miss.; Staley Distinguished Visiting Lecturer at Covenant Theological Seminary in St. Louis Mo.; Research Scholar-in-Residence at the Christian Studies Center in Memphis Tenn.; Academic Dean of Graham Bible College in Bristol Tenn.; and incidental Lecturer at several other Colleges, Seminaries, and Universities. He was at that time the only person in the World serving on the Executives of both the British Lord's Day Observance Society and the Lord's Day Alliance of the U.S.

Preacher, Theologian, Lawyer, Educationist, Historian, Philosopher and Author, Lee has produced more than 330 publications (including many books) -- and also a multitude of long unpublished manuscripts. Apart from an honorary LL.D., he has 21 earned degrees -- including eleven earned doctorates for dissertations in Education, Law, Literature, Philosophy and Theology.

After the murder of his father, Lee had the joy of leading the murderer in jail (and later also the latter's parents) to Christ. Though loving to study, Lee prefers to preach and lead folk to Christ.

Lee rises early; reads God's Word in eleven languages; then walks a couple of miles before breakfast. He has been round the World seven times; has visited 110 countries (several repeatedly); and also every Continent (except Antarctica). He is in demand as a Promoter of Doctoral Students in Australia, England, Germany, South Africa and the United States. He has also lectured and/or preached in all of those countries, as well as in Brazil, Scotland, Korea, Japan, Namibia, New Zealand, and Zambia.

A diehard predestinarian, Lee now lives in the Commonwealth of Australia -- where he was for twenty years the Professor of Systematic Theology and Caldwell-Morrow Lecturer in Church History at the Queensland Presbyterian Theological College. He and his wife Nellie retired in 2000. They have two children, Johanna Paulina who teaches at Parkridge High School and Anna Marie who teaches at Earnshaw State College.